



---

## **A Report of the: Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee**

# **Annual Report**

**2018- 2019**



**Cardiff Council**

---

## Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee Membership



Councillor Nigel Howells  
(Chairperson)



Councillor Iona Gordon



Councillor Jane Henshaw



Councillor Gavin Hill-John



Councillor Thomas Parkhill



Councillor Adrian Robson



Councillor Abdul Sattar



Councillor Elaine Simmons<sup>1</sup>



Councillor Ed Stubbs

---

<sup>1</sup> Councillor Simmons was a Member of the Committee until March 2019

## TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

- To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of economic regeneration.
  - Cardiff City Region City Deal
  - Inward Investment and the marketing of Cardiff
  - South East Wales Economic Forum
  - Economic Strategy & Employment
  - European Funding & Investment
  - Small to Medium Enterprise Support
  - Cardiff Harbour Authority
  - Lifelong Learning
  - Leisure Centres
  - Sports Development
  - Parks & Green Spaces
  - Libraries, Arts & Culture
  - Civic Buildings
  - Events & Tourism
  - Strategic Projects
  - Innovation & Technology Centres
  - Local Training & Enterprise
- To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.
- To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures, which may enhance Council performance or service delivery in this area.

## CHAIR'S FOREWORD

We have had another busy year and I am pleased that Committee Members have shared the workload, participating in task & finish inquiries and on our visits to various sites. These visits included the Library Services storage stacks in Dominions Way, Council-owned workshop sites across Cardiff, as part of our '*Council Workshops and Innovation Premises*' Inquiry, and a visit to the Principality Stadium, as part of our '*Events in Cardiff*' Inquiry. These visits made tangible some of the challenges facing services. Critically, the visits enabled us to hear directly from stakeholders, those using our services and those working in partnership with us to provide services. This is a vital aspect of scrutiny and we have worked to encourage stakeholders to participate and enhance our work throughout the year, at committee and via task groups, in person and in writing. I would like to thank all those who have contributed to our work over the year, including Cabinet Members, partner organisations, service users and residents. Of course, the work we do, and its quality, depends on the support we receive from officers within the scrutiny service. In this respect, we are very lucky in Cardiff to have excellent, hard-working officers to support the work we do. A special mention to our Principal Scrutiny Officer, Angela Holt, whose dedication and professionalism has helped to shape the quality of our reports and recommendations.

As a Committee, we are committed to adding value and focusing our time accordingly. We sought the input of Cabinet Members and senior officers when setting our work programme, asking for their views on where scrutiny resource can be best utilised. This led to our selecting two areas for detailed scrutiny this year - our inquiry into '*Council Workshops & Innovation premises*' and our inquiry into '*Events in Cardiff*'. I am sincerely grateful to all those who contributed ideas, experiences and expertise and to my task group colleagues, Councillor Gavin Hill-John, Councillor Robson, Councillor Iona Gordon, Councillor Jane Henshaw and Councillor Thomas Parkhill for their time and assistance in undertaking and completing these important reports. We trust that our inquiry reports will be of use to the administration in deciding the way forward for these areas that are key to the future of Cardiff's economy.

Throughout the year, we have championed the need for sustainable development, particularly the need to use the benefits of economic development to boost the provision of high quality, affordable and reliable public transport. We have another interesting year ahead, scrutinising the implementation of the new vision for Economic Development and its interface with the City Deal as well as changes to frontline services. We are determined to work constructively to drive improvement for residents, visitors, businesses and partners in our policies and services and to challenge proposals from a sustainable development perspective, in light of the Climate Change emergency we all face.



**Councillor Nigel Howells**

**Chair, Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee**

## 2018-19 INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW

The Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing policy development across a range of Council services. The Committee hears from diverse witnesses to inform this work, including relevant Cabinet Members, council officers, partner organisations, citizens and service users. During 2018–19, Committee Members scrutinised items across several Cabinet Portfolio areas, as follows:

- Cllr Huw Thomas – Leader
- Cllr Peter Bradbury – Culture & Leisure
- Cllr Russell Goodway – Investment & Development
- Cllr Sarah Merry – Education, Employment & Skills
- Cllr Michael Michael - Clean Streets, Recycling and Environment
- Cllr Lynda Thorne – Housing & Communities.

The Directorates predominantly covered by the Committee's terms of reference are Economic Development; and People & Communities: Housing & Communities. This report presents the Committee's activities during 2018-19 and, where possible, identifies the impact of the Committee's work upon the areas within its remit. Between June 2018 and May 2019, the Committee scrutinised a wide range of topics, which are listed below.

### **Inquiries**

Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet.

- Cabinet Response: Funding of Parks Inquiry (*October 2018*)
- Council Workshops and Innovation Premises (*November 2018*) and Cabinet Response to this (*April 2019*)
- Events in Cardiff (*February 2019*).

### **Policy Development and/or Review**

Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a

timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required.

- Adult Community Learning – Welsh Government Consultation
- Innovation
- Dumballs Road regeneration
- Employment/ Employability Services
- Leisure Management Partnership with GLL
- Informing a Music Strategy: Music Ecosystem and Strategic Recommendations
- Cardiff Harbour Authority – Review of current arrangements.

### **Pre-Decision**

Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision.

- Britannia Park – Harbour Drive
- Multi- Purpose Indoor Arena
- Securing Council Funding for Heritage Buildings
- Public Space Protection Order: Proposed Dog Controls
- Economic Development White Paper route
- Corporate Plan 2019-22 and Budget 2019/20
- Draft Economic Strategy: Economic Development White Paper.

### **Monitoring**

Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance and progress in implementing actions previously agreed.

- Directorate Delivery Plan – Economic Development; People & Communities: Housing & Communities
- Quarterly Performance Reports – Economic Development; People & Communities: Housing & Communities – including performance briefing.
- Budget Monitoring – Month 4, Month 6 and Month 9
- Welsh Public Library Standards 6<sup>th</sup> Framework
- Cardiff City Region City Deal: Joint Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

## **Call- In**

Where a non-Executive Member invokes the Call-In procedure under the Council's Constitution, to review an Executive Decision prior to implementation.

- None

Over the period June 2018 – May 2019 we held 10 committee meetings and wrote 19 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing our comments, recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. Three of our committee meetings were webcast and received 184 views. The majority of these were for our Joint meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee when we considered the proposed Public Space Order: Dog Controls; this meeting was also streamed on Facebook and received 699 views.

We also held 2 forum meetings – one to consider our work programme and the other to consider the Welsh Government's consultation proposals for Adult Community Learning. The Committee ran 2 task and finish inquiries, both of which have presented their reports to Cabinet this year.

A constant theme throughout the year has been our concern to ensure that proposals for economic development are compatible with our commitment to sustainable development. As well as being a requirement of the Well Being & Future Generations Act, the need for sustainability principles to underpin and shape economic development is clear from the Climate Change emergency that we face. This was something Council discussed in March 2019, where we passed a motion to work with partners to develop and implement best practice in delivering carbon reductions, helping to limit global warming.

The following pages highlight the Committee's key activities during 2018-19, identify the comments and recommendations made and the Cabinet responses to these.

## Cabinet Response: Funding of Parks Inquiry

---

In October 2018, we received the response from Cabinet to our recommendations made following our Funding of Parks Inquiry (*April 2018*). Our Inquiry explored a wide range of income generation and cost reduction approaches used by other local authorities. We invited contributions from a range of stakeholders, including Friends Groups, sports pitch users and partner wildlife organisations. We also heard from the Cardiff Civic Society, Urban Park Rangers and Community Park Rangers, senior officers and Councillor Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member with responsibility for Parks and Green Spaces.

Our Inquiry found little scope for further cost reductions without significantly affecting the Council's ability to maintain Cardiff's parks to their current standard. In terms of generating income, we found scope to generate more income by using a number of approaches, although some of these would require changes, such as additional concessions in Parks.

Our recommendations centred on clarifying the purpose and focus for Parks Services, in order to direct the scale, scope and acceptable routes for income generation. We also recommended that there be no further cuts to the Park Ranger service.

Out of thirteen recommendations, Cabinet accepted nine in full and partially accepted three. One recommendation was not accepted; this was in relation to there being no further cuts to the budget that pays for urban and community park rangers. The Cabinet Response stated that Cabinet could not allow budget decisions to be tied into specific Scrutiny recommendations. We are pleased to note that, when the budget was set for 2019/20, there were no savings proposals put forward for the Park Ranger services.

In a press release issued at the time of the Cabinet Response, Cabinet Member for Leisure and Culture, Cllr Peter Bradbury said: "*This report has brought some really good ideas to the table and I am grateful to scrutiny for the hard work which has gone into it.....The Scrutiny report has come up with some really worthwhile recommendations which we will pursue.*"

Officers have developed an action plan to implement the agreed recommendations; we will monitor progress in delivering these.



## Council Workshops and Innovation Premises

---

We received a request to undertake an inquiry into the way forward re Council-owned workshops and innovation premises, to help inform policy development in these areas.

In August 2018, we visited council workshops across the city to see the range of sizes and types of units provided and to meet with businesses to hear their views on existing provision. We then heard evidence from Cabinet Members, senior officers, Cardiff University, the University of South Wales, and Gareth Jones, co-founder of Welsh Innovation Centre for Enterprise and The Town Square.

We found a clear need for the Council to continue to provide small, low cost workshops for new and growing businesses. However, several existing sites have rising maintenance costs; we recommended that these sites be disposed and the monies received used to invest in more suitable workshop spaces. We found significant growth in the supply of a range of innovation spaces, from universities, the finance industry, co-working and solo working spaces; consequently, there is less need for Council involvement in the provision of innovation space. We observed a need to think through how we help businesses to become 'market ready' and move to private sector provision. Significantly, we heard that there is a gap in the availability of in-depth advice and mentoring for new start and growing businesses, hampering the growth of innovation.

Our recommendations addressed these findings, with a clear steer to provide new, more suitable workshop spaces, assist businesses to become market-ready and fill the gap identified in existing advice and mentoring services.

Out of nine recommendations, Cabinet accepted six in full and partially accepted three, agreeing that the Council needs to work with partners in the public sector and across the business sectors to meet demand for workshop and innovation premises and stating that this approach will form the basis of its strategy for supporting innovation. The Cabinet response also highlights the difficulties in ring-fencing capital receipts at a time when the Council needs to find resources to fund its Capital Programme; as such earmarking of receipts is limited but possible in specific circumstances.

## Events in Cardiff

---

We received a request from Councillor Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member Culture & Leisure, to undertake an inquiry into events in Cardiff, focusing on what the programme of events in Cardiff should look like and what the role of the Council should be regarding events.

To inform the Inquiry, we heard from Cabinet Members, senior officers, Welsh Government officers, South Wales Police, Cardiff & Vale Local Health Board, event organisers, For Cardiff (*Cardiff's Business Improvement District*), Cardiff Hoteliers Association, Professor Terry Stevens and John Rostron, a local music consultant. The Inquiry received written contributions from Artes Mundi, South Wales Fire & Rescue Services, Public Health Wales and a group of Pontcanna & Riverside residents. As part of the Inquiry, we visited the Principality Stadium to hear their views. We also looked at recent Cardiff Council consultations that included respondents views re events in Cardiff. Desk based research was undertaken into approaches used by other local authorities and a high-level review of recent developments regarding Events Levy and Tourism Tax was also undertaken.

We found that events are worthwhile for Cardiff, both economically and socially, enhancing citizens' lives and supporting many jobs and businesses in Wales. However, they also bring costs to statutory services, which are not recompensed. All of these factors, coupled with the reduction in available Council resources, mean it is time to rethink our approach to events in Cardiff.

Our recommendations aim to place Cardiff Council in an enabling and facilitative role, retaining in-house our key function of coordinating partner efforts, consolidating our strategic approach, developing a signature event, lobbying for increased funding to meet the costs incurred by statutory services, and responding to the concerns of affected communities. Cardiff needs to further strengthen its events calendar and increase the legacy and impact of events, for the benefit of local communities and Wales.

Councillor Henshaw presented the report to the Cabinet at its meeting on 21 March 2019; a Cabinet response is scheduled for June 2019.

## **Economic Development & Regeneration**

---

A key role of this Committee is to scrutinise economic development and regeneration initiatives. We look at how to improve the impact these have for citizens and communities, how to maximise benefits such as employment, training and connectivity, and we check that schemes work together and fit cohesively into the wider economy of the city region. We also scrutinise the financial contribution of the Council and whether there are any risks to the Council and, if so, how these are addressed and mitigated. Critically, we explore the creative tensions that can exist in requiring both economic development to boost job opportunities and increase local wealth and sustainable development that helps tackle climate change. These tensions are not insurmountable - we can pursue inclusive growth that is low-carbon and we can garner community benefits that tackle climate change – as long as there is discussion with partners about the need for these, from the initial design stage onwards.

This year, the Committee has focused on a number of high-profile proposals, as set out below.

### **Dumballs Road regeneration**

The Dumballs Road regeneration site is circa 40 acres and is within the Cardiff Central Enterprise Zone. The Council is working with the developer, Vastint, to agree a comprehensive plan for the site. In October 2018, we received a presentation from Vastint and specifically explored issues relating to proposed commercial units, employment & training opportunities, community space and the liaison process with existing businesses located on the site, as well as our overarching themes regarding sustainability, fit with other schemes and the wider economy, the financial contribution of the Council and risks to the Council.

Overall, we support the proposed design concepts, including the commitment to create connected, mixed and balanced communities in a development that integrates with surrounding areas, both North / South and East / West. We also support the commitment to providing public and private green and open spaces. This is a strategically important site for the Council, both in terms of location and in terms of the opportunities it affords to showcase economic development and sustainable development in practice. An example of

this is the ability to co-locate home and working spaces, reducing the need for travel and thus tackling one of the key sources of climate change.

We agree with the intended move away from heavier industrial uses towards different types of commercial use, including spaces for creative industries and co-working enterprises and hope that these spaces can also accommodate lighter, craft-style industries, such as ceramics. Our task and finish work on Workshops and Innovation premises demonstrated there is significant demand for these types of spaces. We recommended that Vastint talk to the Creative Industries departments at Cardiff University, Cardiff Metropolitan University and the University of South Wales for further insight into their student and alumni experiences, to help frame the commercial offer to meet local demand. Given the time for redeveloping the site, we also thought it would be worthwhile speaking to the local universities and to the Creative Cardiff network about how to use available spaces productively and sympathetically during the redevelopment phases for 'meanwhile uses'.

At the meeting, we highlighted that, as this is a large-scale redevelopment, there should be employment and training opportunities for the local population. We were pleased to hear that the Council will help to establish links between Vastint and the Cardiff & Vale College in order to ensure training opportunities are maximised.

We were interested to hear that Vastint and the Council are working with existing tenants to help them to relocate to appropriate sites and were pleased to see that most of these have stayed in Cardiff.

In his response to our letter, Councillor Goodway expressed his gratitude for the support of the Committee for this project and stated '*we have taken on board the various views expressed both at the meeting and in your letter*'. He went on to state that '*we will certainly ensure that Vastint link with the city's universities as well as other industry networks to consider how they can meet demand. We will also share with Vastint the work of the Scrutiny Committee on innovation and workshop space.*'

## **Securing Council Funding for Heritage Buildings**

In November 2018, we scrutinised proposals for securing investment into Council owned heritage buildings, including Cardiff Castle, City Hall, Cardiff Market, Mansion House, New Theatre, St David's Hall, the Old Library and the Norwegian Church. We received the report to Cabinet, which included confidential information and provided an outline of the general condition, maintenance backlog and operating costs of the Council's portfolio of heritage buildings. We explored the proposed approach for securing the future of Cardiff's heritage buildings, whether there are any risks to the Council, the timeline and next steps, and the recommendations to Cabinet.

We recommended amendments to the report to Cabinet to include a section on Cardiff Market and to clarify whether there would be a further report to Cabinet on the New Theatre; both of these comments were raised at the Cabinet meeting, with Cabinet committing to bringing a further report on the New Theatre proposals.

We are clear about the value of these heritage buildings for future generations and recognise the need to find alternative uses that sustain their future without diluting their heritage value. As such, we recommended that the Council seek to work with organisations with expertise and experience in securing heritage buildings, and include their views on proposals in future reports to Cabinet. In his response, Councillor Goodway stated *'I will ensure that this is followed up and referenced in future reports.'*

We also highlighted that the Cabinet needs to consider all risks to the Council prior to deciding whether to transfer maintenance costs to lease operators; these are significant buildings and we need to factor in consideration of reputational risk if the handover of these buildings proved unsuccessful. Further work is required to understand fully the possible risks associated with each heritage building, in terms of risks associated with listed building status, trust status, covenants and grant conditions. We have asked that details of these risk assessments be included, with appropriate legal advice, in future reports to Cabinet.

We are clear that we wish to carry out further scrutiny on more detailed proposals as these come forward.

## **Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena**

Following previous scrutiny in 2017-18, Committee Members gave their support for a new Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena, recognising the benefits to the city region from increased footfall that brings with it greater demand for public transport, thus increasing the viability of enhancing our public transport infrastructure. Members also provisionally supported the preferred location, subject to future consideration of additional information regarding financial implications and the business case. During their scrutinies, Members emphasised the importance of high quality, reliable and affordable public transport in supporting the additional visitors to Cardiff to use sustainable transport, thus helping to avoid adding to the congestion in Cardiff and the region and helping to reduce climate change pressures. In addition, Members highlighted the need for officers to explore a range of funding options and to ensure that the business case for the multi-purpose indoor arena clearly detail the likely impact the arena will have on other venues in the city region.

Having scrutinised the outline proposals and options appraisals of potential sites, in November 2018 we considered the next stages of the Indoor Arena development, including the need for independent verification checks of the developer's proposals. We stated that it is essential that the Council has robust, independent advice to ensure that the Council remains legally compliant and achieves value for money in a development as complex as the indoor arena. As such, we gave our support for due diligence, design and pre-development work costs to be met.

We committed to making time available for further scrutiny of proposals as these developed and stated that we wished to receive evidence of market testing to demonstrate the indoor arena development is able to hold its own against competitors. We stated we would also be asking for relevant finance and legal council officers to attend this meeting to provide advice to the Committee and that we are interested in inviting the independent consultants, procured to undertake due diligence, to attend this meeting.

In his response, Councillor Goodway stated that he was '*grateful for the time taken by your colleagues for the constructive input they have provided to what is an exciting project for the city.*' He went on to confirm that market testing had been undertaken in the period following the Committee meeting and that he will provide details of the outcomes of the exercise in the near future. He also confirmed that he was '*happy to bring the item to Scrutiny later with the appropriate officers – including financial and legal officers - as well as any other relevant individuals.*'

## **Britannia Park – Harbour Drive**

In November 2018, we considered a report to Cabinet regarding the acquisition of land at Harbour Drive, Cardiff Bay. The report stated the acquisition would protect the Bay edge for leisure use and provide opportunities for appropriate investment to enhance further the amenity of Cardiff Bay.

Having considered the proposal and any risks to the Council, we gave our support to the proposed acquisition, subject to further due diligence checks and independent valuation of the land, and to the use of Full Repair and Insuring leases, to protect the Council from future costs. We sought reassurance that the site holding costs would not prove onerous and were pleased to hear that land sale receipts and income from venues and future events on the site would meet these.

We have provisionally scheduled scrutiny of the overall Cardiff Bay masterplan, which will include this site, for June/ July 2019 and will be looking to see how this seeks to reduce reliance on cars by increasing ease of use of walking and cycling routes and maximising affordable public transport.

## **Economic Development White Paper route**

Following publication of the Economic Development Green Paper, we committed to scrutinising the consequent White Paper prior to its consideration at Cabinet. In December 2018, we discussed the route forward for the Economic Development White Paper with Councillor Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member – Investment and Development, who expressed his wish to take a draft to Council for debate prior to bringing it to scrutiny.

We appreciated the desire to enable Council to debate this major policy statement prior to decision, recognising this strengthens the role of Council. We also appreciated Councillor Goodway's guarantee that this Committee would have the opportunity to undertake pre-decision scrutiny of the White Paper, prior to Cabinet decision on the White Paper.

As part of this discussion, we identified that the Constitution is silent on White Papers; we recommended that the Council address this at the earliest opportunity, by taking a report through the appropriate channels that sets out a clear process for White Papers.

The original timeline was to take the White Paper to Council in January 2019, bringing it to this Committee the following month; however, Council in January was cancelled due to the risk of snow disruption and the White Paper was subsequently taken to Council in March.

### **Draft Economic Strategy: Economic Development White Paper**

Following debate at Full Council in March 2019, we considered the draft Economic Strategy (White Paper) in April 2019. Overall, Members supported the aims and objectives set out in the Strategy and recognised that it provides a high-level framework giving focus and clarity re priorities. Members made clear that they would look for specific details, including actions, deliverables and timescales, in the raft of plans that will sit beneath this Strategy. We are clear that we will scrutinise these plans to see that they give clarity and accountability to the routes used to deliver these aims and objectives and the underpinning themes of Inclusive Growth and Sustainable Development.

At the meeting, we explored linkages between economic development, transport, education and inclusive growth. We reiterated our belief that good public transport and work to raise pupils' aspirations and access to opportunities are essential for inclusive growth.

Members recommended that an assessment of how the draft Economic Strategy complies with the Wellbeing & Future Generation Act requirements be added to the report to Cabinet. We discussed the metrics listed in the Strategy and suggested that these be grouped by the underpinning themes of Inclusive Growth and Sustainable Development, as this would provide clarity regarding how the administration intends to measure progress in these areas. At the meeting, we asked how the indicators would be used going forward and noted that they will be applied ward by ward to enable targeted action to be taken to address poor performance. We were also interested to hear that they would be used to learn lessons when shaping future projects and intended outcomes and asked for more details on how the metrics shown can be used to achieve this.

We also gave our support to several points raised during the Council debate on the draft White Paper, including: ensuring plans work to reduce NEETS (young people Not in Education, Employment and Training), improve Job Opportunities for Young People in Care, reduce inequalities and develop skills; ensure plans reference the opportunities arising from the removal of Prince Of Wales Bridge tolls, M4 relief road and changes to business rates; and ensure plans address the need to refresh St Mary's Street.



In his response, Councillor Goodway provided an explanation of how the draft Economic Strategy complies with the Wellbeing & Future Generation Act requirements. He also provided a table grouping the metrics by the underpinning themes and gave further details of how the metrics would be used to shape projects.

### **Informing a Music Strategy: Music Ecosystem and Strategic Recommendations**

In April 2019, we received a presentation briefing summarising the findings of the work undertaken by Sound Diplomacy, consultants employed by the Council to map the music ecosystem in Cardiff and provide strategic recommendations to inform the development of a Music Strategy for Cardiff.

Members welcomed Sound Diplomacy's work and were pleased to hear the range of engagement with stakeholders that has highlighted the areas that a Music Strategy would need to address. Given the level of engagement with stakeholders and the need to maintain this engagement and momentum to enable Cardiff to move forward as a Music City, Members recommended that all stakeholders who contributed via Sound Diplomacy engagement events be given the opportunity to comment on the strategic recommendations.

Members believe that a Music Strategy for Cardiff will lead to a number of creative and economic benefits for residents, visitors, businesses and those working in Cardiff, as well as across the region. We are pleased that the proposed scope of strategy is broad, not limited to live music or a particular genre but encompassing all genres and the music ecosystem across the city. We raised our concern that the Music Strategy should ensure that music is accessible and inclusive for all young people, not only in terms of being musicians but also in terms of developing pupils' awareness and skills sets so they can benefit from the range of skilled roles that exist across the music economy.

In terms of the proposed partnership Music Board, we highlighted our belief that the membership of the Board will be critical to the success of work in this area; we were pleased to hear that membership will be broad and inclusive, with a number of sub-groups to provide focus on particular aspects.

Members highlighted their wish to be involved in policy development and pre-decision scrutiny of the Music Strategy as it progresses.

## City Deal

---

In June 2018, Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader, in his capacity as a member of the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal Joint Cabinet and portfolio lead member for City Deal, attended committee to present a report that proposed establishing a Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee (JOSC) for the City Deal.

We considered the proposals, in particular looking at the draft terms of reference and matters concerning the nominated representative and deputy, such as: the length of appointment; the skill set required; and whether to have remuneration for the Chair of the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

Overall, we supported the establishment of a JOSC, recognising this does not preclude local authority scrutiny committees deciding to carry out individual scrutiny of City Deal. We felt that nominees should be appointed annually by Council and be experienced scrutineers, who have knowledge of the City Deal and professional skills that will be of value and assistance to their role on the JOSC.

We did not support the proposal for the Chair and Vice Chair of the JOSC to '*rotate annually between the appointing authorities in alphabetical order*'. Rather, the JOSC should decide the Chair and Vice Chair, in line with the guidance issued by the Welsh Government regarding the establishment of JOSC. We did not think that the Chair should be paid, particularly if they already receive a special responsibility allowance.

Our comments were included in the report to Council, considered on 19 July 2018, where Members noted our recommendations and agreed to approve the establishment of a JOSC. The JOSC met for the first time in October 2018.

Since then, we have received three updates on the work of the JOSC, in December 2018, January 2019 and April 2019. We received a copy of hyperlinks to meeting papers and draft minutes in order to see which areas they are planning to scrutinise, in order that we avoid duplication, and to keep abreast of information shared with them.

## Front Facing Services

---

A key role of this Committee is to scrutinise the delivery of front facing services covered by our terms of reference, including employment services, adult community learning, libraries, hubs, leisure and sports. These services are vital to improving people's lives, helping people into work, boosting health and well-being and promoting community cohesion. There have been significant changes to these services in recent years and we prioritised scrutiny of these services to understand the impact of these changes, monitor performance and assess whether there are areas that require improvement.

### Employment Services in Cardiff

In December 2018, we scrutinised progress in delivering the new-style employment services in Cardiff, which launched in April 2018. We wanted to understand take-up and usage rates for these services, for those seeking employment, self-employed and start-ups as well as employers.

We were impressed with the range and scope of the services provided and the number of locations that offer job clubs. We felt that there may be scope for additional venues and were pleased that this met with a positive response.

We felt that there is an opportunity to provide longer-term support to start-ups, many of which fail in the first five years. We are pleased that this has been acknowledged by Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing & Communities, in her response to this scrutiny and that, in future, our Into Work Self Employment Advisor will hold '*pop-up follow up*' sessions to offer practical support to these start-ups.

We also recommended that officers investigate opportunities to commercialise their services re support for businesses and are pleased that this has been agreed and that services will be advertised to local businesses.

We are aware of concerns regarding changes to funding and have asked for any proposals relating to this to come for pre-decision scrutiny, which Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing & Communities has stated she is happy to take place.

## Adult Community Learning – Welsh Government Consultation

We held a forum meeting to consider the draft response from Cardiff Council to the Welsh Government's proposals to change the funding for Adult Community Learning (ACL).

Following our scrutiny, we wrote to the Welsh Government, asking that they count our letter as an official response to their consultation document. We expressed our deep concern about the impact on adult learning in Cardiff that all of the proposed models will have if implemented in their current form; these all show at least a 50% reduction in funding. We outlined our responsibility for scrutinising adult community learning and that, over recent years, we have noted great improvements in performance. We highlighted that our scrutinies have demonstrated the significant improvement to individual's life chances that effective adult learning provides; these benefits ripple out to family members, local communities and, ultimately, the whole economy of the region.

We gave our whole-hearted support and endorsement to Cardiff Council's response and to the recent approach to link Into Work and Adult Community Learning. Our response was included in the Welsh Government's list of consultation responses. We await the outcome from this consultation and are committed to scrutinising proposals developed in response to this.

## Libraries & Hubs

In May 2018, we scrutinised proposals to create community and well-being hubs in the north and west of Cardiff, via community branch libraries. We also explored proposals re Central Library and plans to develop a new Library Strategy.

We highlighted that we wish to carry out further scrutiny as proposals develop, in particular re capital funding and significant changes to current buildings. We recommended that proposed area reviews take into account public transport linkages and are pleased that Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing & Communities, accepted this recommendation.

As part of our scrutiny role, in August 2018 we visited the Library Stacks at Dominion Way in order to understand how these work and the reviews currently underway to catalogue

collections. We discussed how best to care and conserve antique and rare books and collections as well as how to increase accessibility to the public. We considered the need to dispose of duplicate materials to reduce the storage space required, meaning that the stacks could move to more suitable accommodation. We also highlighted our view that some of the artwork stored in the stacks may have commercial potential, in terms of leasing it to local companies that may wish to support Welsh artists.

In January 2019, we considered the Welsh Government's annual assessment of library services, which reported our performance against the sixth set of Welsh Public Library Standards 2017-2020 '*Connected and Ambitious Libraries*'. We found that our performance has improved and that we are performing well compared to other library services in Wales. We heard that we are not meeting one of the twelve core entitlements, which is to have an overall library strategy, but that work on this is underway. We also heard that, out of ten quality indicators that have targets, we are not meeting three of these in full. However, we received explanations of the reasons for this and were satisfied that steps are in place to improve performance i.e. staff are undertaking recognised librarianship qualifications; and a new library management system is being implemented which will make it easier for customers to access available materials, in person and virtually.

In February 2019, we looked at budgetary proposals 2019-20 for libraries and hubs and highlighted that Members are keen to play a role in consultation events, as local ward members, so that plans are amended to reflect local communities' preferences and needs. We are pleased with the reassurances received that this is the case and that the role of ward members, in terms of informing plans and encouraging take-up from residents, is appreciated.

We have provisionally scheduled scrutiny of the draft Libraries Strategy for June 2019.

#### Leisure Management Partnership with GLL

In 2016, GLL took over responsibility for managing most of the Council's leisure centres. In December 2017, Committee Members scrutinised the first year of operation of the partnership. Members were keen to test whether the partnership was meeting the needs of Cardiff citizens and communities and issued a press release seeking the views of citizens of Cardiff on how the leisure centres were being run. Responses were received from over

70 residents, with responses collated and shared with Committee Members and the partnership. At the meeting, Committee Members used these responses to frame lines of enquiry with the partnership.

In January 2019, we scrutinised the performance of the Council and GLL over the last year in the delivery of leisure centre services covered by the Leisure Centre Management Partnership contract. We focused in particular on participation and usage rates, use of leisure centre rooms by public sector organisations and delivery of the capital programme. We also asked whether there are any planned changes to services and checked whether there are any changes to the Council's commitments or risks to the Council.

We were pleased to hear that there is genuine partnership working via a strong liaison board that receives robust monitoring information and works together to develop the leisure offer for Cardiff. We were delighted with the improving trends re participation and usage rates and the targeted work to increase participation by people with disabilities, resulting in increased membership levels. We tested the willingness of GLL to keep prices as affordable as possible and to enhance accessibility by widening opening hours and were pleased to hear positive responses on both of these. To help to continue to drive improved customer satisfaction, we asked to receive the number of complaints per 100,000 visits in future monitoring reports.

We were reassured that the capital programme is on track and that no new commitments or risks to the Council have been identified. Finally, we confirmed that we wished to hear more details of work, in 2019, to improve further the leisure offer in Cardiff; we look forward to hearing more details of this in due course.

#### Public Space Protection Order (PSPO): Proposed Dog Controls

In November 2018, we held a joint Committee Meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee to carry out policy development scrutiny of a report to Cabinet on PSPO: Proposed Dog Controls. Whilst dog fouling comes under the remit of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee, the proposals included banning dogs from sports pitches and this Committee therefore wanted to have the opportunity to comment.

As part of this scrutiny, we considered the consultation exercise undertaken regarding the proposals and heard from a range of stakeholders, at the meeting and via written

contributions, including: residents of Cardiff; local councillors, including a representative of the All Party Council Group Caring4K9s; local dog owners; Guide Dog Cymru; Creigiau Recreation Area Management Committee; Cardiff Dog Action; and The Dogs Trust.

Following our scrutiny, Councillor Bradbury wrote *'I would like to thank scrutiny for your review. The process has supported a connection and engagement with Cardiff Dog Action and other dog groups'*. He continued that he had *'committed to meeting Cardiff Dog Action and other groups regularly'*.

During our scrutiny, stakeholders highlighted the need for an Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) to be completed to ensure the final PSPO for Dog Controls was appropriate and fit for purpose. We re-iterated this point in our letter and Councillor Bradbury responded that an EqIA would be completed *'by engaging with Guide Dogs Cymru and other vulnerable user groups'*.

We also highlighted concerns with the consultation survey, in terms of language used and structure: in his response, Councillor Bradbury stated *'We have learnt from the consultation survey and may ask scrutiny to review any similar city wide consultation surveys before commencement.'*

Based on the evidence presented to our Committee via written contributions and at the meeting, we listed various schemes and measures for improving dog behaviours and suggested that the Council explore these further. In his response, Councillor Bradbury committed to work with Cardiff Dog Action and other groups *'to look at schemes to support good dog ownership behaviours across Cardiff. This will include reviewing ideas suggested by scrutiny.'*

Finally, we requested that the planned report to Cabinet be brought for pre-decision scrutiny, which was agreed to by Councillor Bradbury. In March 2019, final proposals for a PSPO: Dog Controls were released, which showed that the PSPO had been amended to exclude sports pitches. The Environmental Scrutiny Committee therefore undertook the consequent pre-decision scrutiny.

## Corporate Plan 2019-22 and Budgetary Proposals 2019-20

---

At our February 2019 meeting, we considered the Council's draft Corporate Plan and draft budgetary proposals for 2019–20. Members:

- Recommended the step '*to develop a business plan to protect the city's historic assets*', which was in the Corporate Plan 2018-2021, be included in the final version of the Corporate Plan presented to Council.
- Highlighted that we intend to scrutinise the step '*Develop a new vision and masterplan for Cardiff Bay by 2020, including taking forward delivery of the next phase of development for the International Sports Village by 2019*'.
- Highlighted that we will recommend to a future committee that they scrutinise progress on achieving savings that fall within our terms as reference, as well as capital financing and the affordability envelope for the Indoor Arena
- Welcomed the proposal from Councillor Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance, Modernisation & Performance to discuss budget consultation with Scrutiny Chairs and Scrutiny members, in an effort to boost engagement.
- Noted the significant levels of savings from the Economic Directorate
- Raised our concerns about the impact of the savings relating to events, tourism, marketing and business events, striking a note of caution that many partner organisations are also facing budget reductions.
- Clearly stated our wish to scrutinise any new proposed operating model for the New Theatre.
- Re-iterated our long-standing desire to boost the number of park rangers, whom our Inquiry into Funding of Parks in Cardiff (April 2018) found are critical in ensuring our parks are safe spaces and that volunteers contributions are maximised.
- Confirmed our wish to scrutinise the Welsh Government review of Cardiff Harbour Authority funding arrangements.
- Restated our commitment to scrutinising changes to adult community learning, libraries and hubs.

Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member - Finance, Modernisation and Performance, responded, noting the above points and thanking the Committee for their support in the budget process.



## Monitoring

---

### Performance Monitoring

We decided to continue the approach we trialled in 2018/19 to scrutinising performance, receiving quarter 1, 2 and 3 performance reports by email, with a summary of key points provided by the Committee's Scrutiny Officer. We then had the opportunity to review the reports, raise any concerns and, where necessary, request that the relevant Cabinet Member and officer be invited to the next Committee meeting to discuss performance issues and mitigating actions. We would still receive the quarter 4 report at committee, to enable Members to review the whole year performance.

In June 2018, we considered the quarter 4 performance report for 2017/18. We found that, overall, there is good performance against targets across the Economic Development Directorate and that the performance levels achieved across libraries, hubs, into work services and adult community learning, in the Housing & Communities Directorate, are pleasing. As part of our discussions, we focused on high street footfall; we believe it would be beneficial to learn lessons from approaches taken elsewhere that have boosted daytime economy footfall on high streets.

We also discussed whether our performance reports contain appropriate indicators that capture the impact of the Economic Development Directorate and were pleased to hear the Director say he is open to reviewing indicators; to inform this, we agreed to look at indicators used by other local authorities to see whether other performance indicators would be useful and helpful.

In September 2018, we considered a desk-based review of economic development performance indicators reported to scrutiny in the core cities of Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Leeds and Sheffield. The number of performance indicators reported to scrutiny ranged from nine to 32. They all included indicators for economic activity and most had indicators re businesses, GVA, skills and visitor economy.

We received the other quarterly performance reports by email; there were no issues in these that necessitated consideration at Committee. We are due to scrutinise the quarter 4 2018/19 report at committee meeting in June/ July 2019.

## Budget Monitoring

We decided to also continue with the approach to budget monitoring that we trialled in 2018/19, receiving Month 4, Month 6 and Month 9 budget monitoring reports by email, with a summary highlighting key areas to look at provided by the Committee's Scrutiny Officer. These reports highlighted no issues, in the areas that we cover, that required scrutiny at committee.

## Directorate Delivery Plans

We considered the relevant sections of the Housing & Communities Directorate Delivery Plan at our meeting in May 2018 and the Economic Development Directorate Delivery Plan at our meeting in June 2018.

We assessed whether these Plans assisted in the delivery of Cardiff's Wellbeing Plan and the Council's Corporate Plan, whether they focused on the right issues for local communities and whether the plans were robust and fit for purpose. We checked whether resources were sufficient to deliver the Plans and whether the performance measures were sufficient to monitor delivery.

We found that the Plans were fit for purpose and that there was a sound process and performance management framework in place to monitor implementation and delivery. We used the information gained regarding future challenges and proposed actions to help inform our work programme for 2018-19.

## WORK PROGRAMME FOR 2019- 20

Members of the Committee will be invited to consider items for possible inclusion in the Committee's work programme during 2019-20. Work is currently in progress to draw together issues for the Committee to consider. A draft work programme will then be developed and brought to Committee for approval and implementation. The Committee would welcome suggestions for scrutiny items from other Members.

## FUTURE SCRUTINY WORK

Over the course of its deliberations this year, the Committee has recommended that the following items be considered for inclusion in the Committee's 2019-20 work programme:

- ❖ Cardiff Capital Region City Deal.
- ❖ Cardiff Bus Station.
- ❖ Metro Central - Cardiff Central Station.
- ❖ Cardiff East Industrial Strategy.
- ❖ Music Strategy.
- ❖ Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena.
- ❖ International Sports Village.
- ❖ Dumballs Road regeneration.
- ❖ Cardiff Bay regeneration.
- ❖ Heritage Buildings.
- ❖ Canal Quarter Masterplan.
- ❖ Chapters Arts Centre.
- ❖ Other Economic Development plans.
- ❖ Cardiff Harbour Authority.
- ❖ Cardiff Sport.
- ❖ Sports & Physical Activity Strategy.
- ❖ Leisure Management.
- ❖ Libraries Strategy.
- ❖ Libraries & Hubs.
- ❖ Welsh Library Standards.
- ❖ Performance Reports.
- ❖ Savings Reports.
- ❖ Relevant Audit, Inspection and Regulatory Reports.
- ❖ Cabinet Responses to previous Inquiries, and implementation of agreed recommendations from previous Inquiries.

Scrutiny Services, Cardiff Council,  
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW.  
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)  
© 2019 Cardiff Council