



A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2017 – 2018

May 2018



City and County of Cardiff

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Ramesh Patel
(Chairperson)



Councillor Philippa Hill -
John



Councillor Owen Jones



Councillor John Lancaster



Councillor Chris Lay



Councillor Norma Mackie



Councillor Oliver Owen



Councillor Peter Wong



Councillor Ashley Wood

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

2017/18 has been both a busy and interesting year for Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee. We started the year with a new administration, eight brand new councillors, one old hand and the task of scrutinising Cardiff's environmental priorities. In short, it was a tough challenge.

The Committee started its work last July by developing a work programme which was supported by valuable contributions from the Cabinet and service areas. To support this exercise we ran a scrutiny induction, provided the new Members with plenty of background information and arranged a series of visits to facilities including Lamby Way, the Kelda Anaerobic Digestion Facility and the Viridor Incinerator. All of this work helped the new Members achieve a basic grounding in the areas covered by the Committee.

Initial scrutiny focused on theme based topics instead of looking at policy decisions and performance monitoring, for example, in September and October we scrutinised important public issues such as recycling, street cleansing, taxis and food hygiene. This approach I believe allowed us to focus on topics relevant to the public and provided the new Members with vital information on key front line services.

As the year progressed we broadened the range of work undertaken to include pre decision scrutiny, policy development and performance management of a range of topics. This involved running 12 public committee meetings; scrutinising 36 individual items; inviting 55 witnesses to the Committee and welcoming 38 external witnesses to take part in various scrutiny events. In addition to this we were proactive in terms of our need to improve scrutiny public engagement by producing regular media briefs and webcasting all of our public meetings – which received 476 views during the year.

During the year we used our Committee letters to raise a number of important issues, for example, we encouraged the development of ward based action

plans for managing street cleansing; we consistently challenged the high sickness rates across a range of front line Council services; we recommended the running of targeted food hygiene events to support harder to reach food catering establishments; we expressed concern at the frequency with which taxis block bus lanes & asked for a review of taxi rank provision in the city; we expressed concern at the lack of detail for the digitalisation savings in the consultation budget; and during budget scrutiny we highlighted the increasing borrowing costs required to support the Council's Capital Programme.

The most significant piece of work undertaken during the year was the task & finish exercise into 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. This piece of work considered the current air quality position; the development of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy; the Welsh Government position on air quality; transportation; a range of other pollution sources; planning & development; sustainable fuels and clean air zones.

Delivering the 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' task & finish exercise involved holding nine task group meetings; 17 separate witness sessions; speaking with 38 expert witnesses; Scrutiny Research reports on best practice in 'Clean Air Zones' and an emissions review of Cardiff's public sector fleet; and the areas being used to structure Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy (for example, Transportation, Planning, Sustainable Fuel).

Key recommendations made in the Improving Cardiff's Air Quality report included putting Public health at the heart of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy; creating a low emission zone in Westgate Street by focusing on reducing NO₂ emissions from diesel buses; pushing for more sustainable fuel infrastructure for Cardiff to support the growth in the use of low emission vehicles; greater regional planning with neighbouring local authorities organisations to help reduce emissions cause by commuter travel; accelerating public transport and active travel infrastructure, for example, more bus and cycle lanes; using short term initiatives within the Council's control to drive modal shift, for example, 20 mph zones and resident parking schemes and for the Council to lead by example, for example, by switching the Council fleet to low emission vehicles and building in the use of low emission fuels into the Council procurement

process. As a Committee we hope that the recommendations will help to provide the Council with some direction on how to deal with our air quality challenges.

To conclude my foreword I would like to thank all of the Members of the Committee, the Cabinet, external witnesses and officers who have supported our work. In particular, it has been a pleasure to work with an excellent group of new councillors who have, without exception, actively engaged in their new roles at every single meeting. I look forward to your continued support in the year to come.



Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson - Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2017/18. Between July 2017 and May 2018 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the City. During 2017/18 examples included:
 - Managing Street Cleanliness & Total Street Scene in Cardiff
 - Managing Recycling in Cardiff
 - Greener Grangetown – Member Update
 - Roles & Responsibilities for Flood Risk Management in Cardiff
 - Roath Flood Scheme

- **Call In Meetings** - Where the Committee considers a request made by a non-Executive Member to review a recent Executive decision on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the City. During 2017/18 examples included:
 - Funding the New Bus Transport Interchange

- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2017/18 examples included:
 - Cabinet Response to Managing Section 106 Funding for the Development of Community Projects
 - Improving Cardiff's Air Quality
 - Managing Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff

- Consideration of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Draft Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality – Task & Finish Exercise'
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2015/16 examples included:
 - City Operations Directorate - Quarter 1 & 2 Performance Reports 2017/18
 - Commercial & Collaborative Services – Quarter 1 & 2 Performance Reports 2017/18
- **Policy Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example, by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required. During 2017/18 examples included:
 - City Operations Digitalisation Projects
 - Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021
 - Managing Food Hygiene in Cardiff
 - Cardiff's Taxi Services
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. During 2015/16 examples included:
 - First Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report
 - Draft Budget Proposals 2018/19 – Corporate Overview
 - Draft Corporate Plan 2018 to 2021 & 2018/19 Draft Budget Proposals - Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio

- Draft Corporate Plan 2018 to 2021 & 2018/19 Draft Budget Proposals – Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio
- Coastal Risk Management Programme
- New Burial Space
- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality – Welsh government Direction
- Cardiff District Heat Network
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held 11 committee meetings and wrote 13 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.

BRIEFING INFORMATION

Managing Street Cleanliness & Total Street Scene in Cardiff (5 September 2017)

The meeting on 5 September 2017 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Managing Street Cleanliness & Total Street Scene in Cardiff'. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. The purposed of the report was to:

- Provide Members with a briefing on how the Council deals with litter, street cleansing and total street scene in Cardiff. In particular the item considered the various categories of litter; the resources available to tackle litter; the challenges of managing litter in Cardiff; litter management campaigns and recent Local Environmental Audit & Management System (LEAMS) results.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- **Ward Action Plans** – All of the Members agreed that creation of the ward based action plans to help improve cleanliness and street scene was a good idea; several of the newly elected Members were a little concerned as to why this approach didn't already exist. They agreed that trialling the new plans across a few wards was a positive idea and that the trial sample should include wards with differing characteristics.
- **Waste Enforcement – Landlord v Tenant Responsibility** – Members asked the Cabinet Member to find out more about the success that other local authorities had achieved in dealing with waste enforcement issues at rental properties by involving landlords at the earliest possible opportunity.

- **Cathays** – Members were concerned that over 45% of the fines issued were within that ward which seemed disproportionately high when compared to all other wards. A Member questioned if too much waste enforcement had been carried out in Cathays to the annoyance of permanent residents and suggested that a review of the current waste enforcement approach was required and that this should include detailed consultation with permanent local residents.
- **Fly Tipping** – The Committee was concerned that fly tipping had increased by 28% between 2015/16 and 2016/17. They asked for clarification of the fly tipping definition that the Council is currently working against; a summary of the way that fly tipping incidents are currently reported and logged and a breakdown of the fly tipping incidents by type on a ward by ward basis for 2015/16, 2016/17 and 2017/18 to date.
- **Sickness Rates** – Members emphasised the importance of monitoring sickness levels and have asked for a breakdown of City Operations sickness rates for 2016/17 and 2017/18.
- **LEAMS Performance** – Members asked for an explanation as to why LEAMS performance fell sharply during the period September 2016 to March 2017 and then rapidly improved in the period March 2017 to May 2017.

Greener Grangetown – Member Update (15 May 2018)

The meeting on 15 May 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Greener Grangetown – Member Update'. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide Members with an information update on the Greener Grangetown project; to assess progress achieved to date on the scheme; to consider lessons learnt from the project and to identify future potential opportunities arising for Cardiff from the scheme.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- Members asked about the cost of delivering the Greener Grangetown project. It was highlighted that the contract value had been provided to the Committee (a value of £1,785,853.55); however, a final project close value had not been calculated. An officer agreed to provide the Committee with a copy of the outturn funding report once it became available.
- At the meeting it was explained that local resident feedback would be included as a part of the lessons learnt phase of the project. This would take place after delivery of the project was complete and provide valuable information to the Council and its partners on how to improve delivery of any similar future projects. Members felt that this was a good idea and asked for a detailed explanation of how the local resident feedback will be gathered, stored and reported.
- The Committee asked for a copy of the 'snagging list' to establish the type of final alterations that need to be addressed

Roles & Responsibilities for Flood Risk Management in Cardiff (5 December 2017)

The meeting on 5 December 2017 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Roles & Responsibilities for Flood Risk Management in Cardiff'. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. In addition to this, representatives from Dwr Cymru and Natural Resources Wales were invited to take part in the meeting to explain the role that their respective organisations play in flood risk management. The purpose of the report was to provide Members with the opportunity to review the roles and responsibilities of the Council and its statutory partners in dealing with flood risk in Cardiff. Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- During the meeting an officer from the City Operations Directorate was asked if the Council allocated sufficient funding towards drainage and flood management activities. Overall he felt that adequate monies were spent in this area, however, there was a need for the Council to recruit a new Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS) officer to deal with a range of new statutory responsibilities placed onto the Council. The Committee suggested that given the statutory nature and importance of the role, funding should be made available for recruitment to the post.
- The Committee, recommended that the Cabinet Member liaise with Natural Resources Wales to explore the possibility of setting up a flood group(s) in some of Cardiff's highest flood risk areas.

Roath Flood Scheme (5 December 2017)

The meeting on 15 May 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Roath Flood Scheme'. Representatives from Natural Resources Wales and members of the public were invited to take part in the meeting to debate the merits of continuing with the development of the Roath Flood Scheme. The purpose of the item was to provide Members with the opportunity to review the progress of the development and implementation of the Roath Flood Scheme. Following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent a letter to the lead officer from Natural Resources Wales that was copied into all of the members of the public that took part in the meeting. The letter made the following points:

- The Committee noted the range of consultation activities delivered by Natural Resources Wales during the development of the scheme.
- It was explained during the item that the works to Roath Brook would actually reduce the overall dry land surface area of the parks within the scope of the scheme. Natural Resources Wales acknowledged that this was the case, however, were unable to accurately quantify the exact area that would be lost. The Committee asked for clarification of how much actual dry land surface area would be lost.
- During the meeting Dr Johansson referenced a number of potential alternatives for helping to manage flood risk issues along Roath Brook. The Committee asked for assurance that these alternatives had been considered and evaluated as a part of the development of the scheme.
- The Committee noted that the overall proposal involved the removal of 140 trees and that these would be replaced by 122 new trees. The process for deciding which types of trees to use had been supported by an arboreal study that has been funded by the scheme. The removed trees would be replaced with appropriate specimens; some of these would be mature and approximately four or five metres in height. The overall loss of mature

trees would be 18 in total. The Committee noted that there would be an additional 200 saplings planted by Natural Resources Wales at another site which would in time more than offset the number of trees lost.

CALL IN MEETINGS

Call In Cabinet Decision CAB/17/11 – Funding the New Bus Transport Interchange (13 September 2017)

Members recognised the importance to residents, commuters, visitors, employers and businesses of having a high quality bus transport interchange in place as soon as possible. Committee time was made available to undertake regular scrutiny of proposals as these came forward throughout 2017-18. In all, the Environmental Scrutiny Committee undertook two separate joint scrutinies with the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee on proposals for delivering a new Cardiff Bus Station. These focused on exploring the following with Councillor Russell Goodway – Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and senior officers: funding mechanisms, the fit with neighbouring regeneration proposals for Central Square, Central Train Station and Central Quay; risk management; and deliverability.

Call – In – September 2017 - Following Cabinet approval of the report; this was then Called –In by Councillor McEvoy and, in September 2017, the Committee held a joint meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee, to consider the areas specified in the Call-In.

At the Call-In meeting, Members heard from Cllr McEvoy and a representative of Cardiff & Vale Bus Users Group, Dr. Max Wallis, as well as Councillor Russell Goodway and senior officers. Having considered the evidence and the Call-in procedure rules set out in the Council's constitution, Members voted not to refer the item to Full Council or the Cabinet for reconsideration.

INQUIRIES

Cabinet Response to Managing Section 106 Funding for the Development of Community Projects (16 January 2018)

The meeting on 16 January 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to Managing Section 106 Funding for the Development of Community Projects. The Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided to the Committee and following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee welcomed the very positive Cabinet response to the report. They were optimistic that the new approach would put local councillors at the heart of the decision making process for identifying suitable community projects to be funded by section 106 contributions.
- The Committee stressed that councillor training on the new process for allocating section 106 funding for community projects would be essential and that it should be supported by wider training on section 106 contributions and other types of planning obligations.
- The Committee were aware that the new process for allocating section 106 funding for community projects would be a first of its kind. This meant that there would probably be a series of teething difficulties and a host of lessons to learn from during the first year, with this in mind the Committee asked for a twelve month review of the process to consider the lessons learnt and progress made to date.

Improving Cardiff's Air Quality

During the Committee work programming process it was decided that the Environmental Scrutiny Committee should prioritise running a task & finish exercise on air quality in the city. An air quality task & finish exercise was scoped and Members agreed to run an inquiry titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. The terms of reference for the exercise is set out below:

The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can help to improve air quality in Cardiff. This will include reviewing:

- ***Current Air Quality Position*** - *to include a report and analysis of the worst affected areas; the major contributing factors to air pollution in Cardiff; resources, monitoring arrangements & statutory responsibilities; the impact on public health; consider any existing air quality action plans for Cardiff; to consider air quality responsibilities placed on the Council.*
- ***Development of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy*** – *to include a report on the aims and objectives of the strategy; associated policies that support the development of the strategy; resources and timescale for delivering the strategy; desired impact of the strategy and the main areas that the strategy will target.*
- ***Welsh Government Position on Air Quality*** – *to gain a better understanding of the policy objectives of the Welsh Government in terms of air quality; to understand the applicable timescales and consequences of the Council not meeting these policy objectives; to identify the key areas that Welsh Government believes should be targeted to achieve the best outcomes for air quality.*
- ***Transportation*** – *to understand the positive and negative impacts that transport (and transport systems) can have on air quality in Cardiff; to establish a hierarchy of transport pollution sources and evaluate what can be done to better manage the worst polluting sources; to review transport*

schemes and infrastructure planned for development or in the process of being delivered in Cardiff; to explore the benefits of sustainable fleet management in Cardiff; to consider the impact that changes in technology and public perception can have on air quality.

- **Other Pollution Sources** – *to consider a range of pollution sources (excluding transport) and the impact that these have upon air quality in Cardiff; to establish a hierarchy of pollution sources (excluding transport) and evaluate what can be done to better manage the worst polluting sources; to review proposals currently being developed or delivered (excluding transport) to reduce pollution in Cardiff.*
- **Planning & Development** – *to understand how the planning and development process can be used to improve air pollution in Cardiff; to consider the current planning processes / policies and how these impact upon air pollution; the impact that the growth of the city might have upon air quality.*
- **Sustainable Fuels** – *to understand the challenges and opportunities that the growth of sustainable fuels can have upon air quality in Cardiff; to consider the role of the Council in terms of helping to establish the local market for sustainable fuels; to consider what the Council and its partners can proactively do to support the move to sustainable fuels.*
- **Clean Air Zones** – *to understand how Clean Air Zones work; the impact that a Clean Air Zone could have upon air quality in Cardiff and the wider implications for the city; the costs and opportunities of setting up a clean air zone; best practice in delivering Clean Air Zones (to include domestic and international examples).*

The work of the task & finish group was extensive and delivering the 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' task & finish exercise involved:

- Nine task group meetings;
- 17 separate witness sessions;

- Dealing with 38 expert witnesses (26 external to the Council and 12 internal to the Council);
- Working closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff developing Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy;
- Scrutiny research reports on best practice in 'Clean Air Zones' and an emissions review of Cardiff's public sector fleet;
- Consideration of the areas being used to structure Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy, for example, Transportation, Planning, Sustainable Fuel;

The report made a series of key findings and 31 recommendations designed to help improving Cardiff's Air Quality. Some of the main themes generated by the recommendations included:

- Putting public health at the heart of Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy – air pollution causes approximately 40,000 premature deaths in the UK each year;
- Creating a low emission zone in Westgate Street by focusing on reducing Nitrogen Dioxide emissions from diesel buses;
- Pushing for more sustainable fuel infrastructure for Cardiff to support the growth in the use of low emission vehicles, for example, electric and hydrogen;
- Greater regional planning with neighbouring local authorities organisations to help reduce emissions cause by commuter travel;
- Accelerating public transport and active travel infrastructure, for example, more bus and cycle lanes;
- Using short term initiatives within the Council's control to drive modal shift, for example, 20 mph zones and resident parking schemes;
- Leading by example, for example, switching the Council fleet to low emission vehicles and building the use of low emission fuels into the Council procurement process.

Managing Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff

During the Committee work programming process it was decided that the Environmental Scrutiny Committee should prioritise running a task & finish exercise on litter and fly tipping during the municipal year. Scoping meetings took place in March and April 2018 and a terms of reference for the inquiry was agreed. This is set out below:

- *To undertake comparative analysis and benchmarking on how other local authorities manage litter & fly tipping, with the main aim of identifying best practice. The comparative analysis and benchmarking should focus on the performance of core cities, Welsh local authorities and cities with a large student population.*
- *To undertake a detailed survey on litter & fly tipping to test public perception on how they feel about litter, fly tipping and wider street cleanliness in Cardiff.*
- *To arrange a number of Member visits to frontline street cleansing and waste enforcement services to help gain a better understanding of the work that they carry out and everyday challenges that they face.*
- *To compare Cardiff's performance in terms of managing litter & fly tipping against best practice identified in the comparative analysis and benchmarking.*

The next steps for this task & finish exercise is to complete the commissioned research; undertake a public survey on litter and fly tipping and to complete a series of front line job shadowing visits for Members to experience first-hand how the Council manages litter and fly tipping.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Quarterly Performance Monitoring – 2017/18

During 2017/18 the Committee received quarterly performance monitoring reports for Quarters 1 and 2 of 2017/18. This focused on the performance of services within the City Operations Directorate and Commercial & Collaborative Services (which at the time was a part of the Economic Development Directorate). The main comments made during the quarterly performance monitoring scrutiny were:

➤ **City Operations Directorate – Quarters 1 & 2 Performance Reports (5 December 2017)**

- The topic of 20 mile per hour zones was discussed as a part of this item. A Member asked for a list of the objectives attached to the implementation of Cardiff's 20 mile per hour zones and for clarification as to if they had been achieved.

➤ **Commercial & Collaborative Services – Quarters 1 & 2 Performance Reports (5 December 2017)**

- The topic of sickness levels in Commercial Services was considered during the meeting. Members asked how the sickness rates in our waste services compared against other local authorities and were told that the rates of our teams were similar or lower than those in other local authorities. It was also stressed that sickness rates in the private sector were generally lower as they had stricter sickness absence policies. Members acknowledged this and were keen to understand how sickness rates in our waste services compared against the other United Kingdom core cities. They asked for a short benchmarking report to that compare

the sickness rates for Cardiff's waste services against the other United Kingdom core cities.

- At the meeting the Cabinet Member stated that each year Cardiff scheduled approximately 24 million waste collections and that from this total approximately 18,000 were missed. Members were also informed that no overtime was paid for sending crews out to collect the missed collections. As a follow up to this question a Member asked if the Council incurred any additional costs for these missed collections, i.e. costs other than overtime, and if there were could they be provided in writing.

POLICY REVIEW

City Operations Digitalisation Projects (16 January 2018)

The meeting on 16 January 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'City Operations Digitalisation Projects' to explore the progress of implementing digitalisation across the City Operations Directorate in advance of budget scrutiny in February 2018. The Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. The purpose of the report due to be received by Cabinet was:

- To provide Members with the opportunity to review a number of digitalisation projects currently being developed and delivered for services within the City Operations Directorate.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The overall the budget consultation identified a number of digitalisation savings, including 'CONSULT 1' for £212,000 that was allocated against the City Operations Directorate. This potential budget saving fell against the category of 'Income Generation' and was described as:

'Improve Charging & Income Generation Projects – Generate additional income through an increase in fees and charges across City Operations in addition to maximising opportunities for recharging for services, particularly through digitalisation'.

The saving was consistently risk rated as 'Green' and was listed against the Strategic Planning & Transport Cabinet portfolio. At the meeting Members asked for further detail around how the £212,000 saving would be achieved, but were not provided with a sufficiently detailed explanation. The letter to the Cabinet Member explained that the Environmental

Scrutiny Committee was due to scrutinise the budget proposals at a meeting on the 14th February, and that if the 'CONSULT 1' saving of £212,000 still featured as a budget line the Committee would be expecting a more detailed answer.

- At the meeting a number of questions were raised about 'Consult 38' from the '2018/19 Budget Proposals – For Consultation'. This referenced a £1.206 million saving that had been allocated against the Corporate Management budget alongside the title of 'Business Processes including Digitalisation'. The saving was described as:

'Council Wide Efficiencies – In line with the Council's digital strategy, this saving will be achieved through delivering business efficiencies through third party spend, charging processes, technology and staff resources. This will put the use of digital forms of communication and service delivery at the heart of how the Council operates and interacts with the people it serves'.

The saving was consistently risk rated as 'Red – Amber' and was placed under the saving category 'TBC'. It was anticipated that these savings were to be applied 'Council Wide', and as such a part of the £1.206 million saving could be applied against the City Operations Directorate or other services that might fall within the remit of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. Members asked how much (if any) of the saving would be applied against the City Operations Directorate or any other services provided within the remit of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. Officers from the City Operations Directorate were unable to provide an answer to the question, explaining that it was a 'Corporate Management' issue that was still being developed. They were also unable to answer a second question as to whether a detailed business plan had been put in place to ensure that the saving was achieved. Failure to provide an adequate explanation around on how a £1.206 million digitalisation saving was to be achieved and the impact that it would have on services relevant to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee terms of reference left the Committee feeling concerned about the achievability of the savings, and

so the Committee decided to refer the matter to the Chair of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee in advance of budget scrutiny on the 14th February.

- During the meeting it was explained that modern digital technology could deliver efficiency and savings, however, it also required constant additional investment to ensure that all of the necessary upgrades are applied. This means that future technology budgets will need to be supported by regular funding increases to ensure that systems continue to work and that any savings / efficiency gains are not lost. In the letter to the Cabinet Member the Committee pointed out that most major private companies set aside regular increases for technology budgets and the Council should not be any different. This point was noted in the Committee letter to the Chair of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee in reference to the range of 'Council Wide' digitalisation projects.

Update to the Recycling & Waste Management Strategy (17 April 2018)

The meeting on 17 April 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Update to the Recycling & Waste Management Strategy' to review future proposals for recycling and waste management in the city. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The bulk of the detail on the item was provided in a presentation to the Committee titled 'Recycling & Waste Management Strategy 2018 – 2021' that focused on the background to the report; challenges facing the Council in terms of recycling; wheeled bin & glass bottle recycling trials and the consultation exercise for the strategy. Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee looked forward to receiving the draft Cabinet papers on the Recycling & Waste Management Strategy at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting on the 15 May so that they could undertake pre decision scrutiny.
- A Member emphasised the point that there were large differences between the recycling challenges experienced across Cardiff's 29 wards. With this in mind, the Committee felt that a flexible approach should be applied to the development of the revised Recycling & Waste Management Strategy, and that if a recycling proposal wasn't successful in one ward it didn't necessarily mean that it would not work well in another.
- Members were concerned by the comment made by the Cabinet Member that the Commercial Waste Service was only achieving recycling rates of approximately 25%, and that this was having a direct impact on Cardiff's overall recycling rate. The Committee felt that this was something that needed to improve to ensure that recycling rates increased.

- Members agreed that it is important to run a very thorough three month consultation exercise for a strategy. They also stressed the importance of detailed consultation with local ward Members as they hold significant amounts local information about the wards that they represent; this information will be essential in delivering a flexible bespoke Recycling & Waste Management Strategy for Cardiff.

Managing Food Hygiene in Cardiff (3 October 2017)

The meeting on 3 October 2017 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Managing Food Hygiene in Cardiff' to review how food hygiene is managed in the city. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the Shared Regulatory Service. The purpose of the report was to review:

- The role, responsibilities and challenges facing Shared Regulatory Services in managing food hygiene in Cardiff;
- The aims and objectives of Shared Regulatory Services in terms of managing food hygiene in Cardiff;
- Performance targets facing Shared Regulatory Services for managing food hygiene in Cardiff;
- The resources available to Shared Regulatory Services for managing food hygiene in Cardiff.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee acknowledged that the resources available to Shared Regulatory Services for managing food hygiene in Cardiff were limited given the scale of the task. At the same time, the targets set by the Welsh Government for food hygiene were very high; for example, there was a 93% target for PAM/023 that measures the percentage of food establishments which were broadly compliant with food hygiene standards. Considering the challenges faced Members felt that Shared Regulatory Services deserved to be congratulated for the work and results that they delivered.
- **Income Generation** - Members supported the approach taken by Shared Regulatory Services in generating income from some food hygiene related services. The Committee understood that the approach was

relatively new and that it was not realistic for the income raised to fully offset any future funding cuts. With this in mind Committee encouraged the Cabinet Member to continually review best practice across the food hygiene industry to help identify any new potential income streams.

- **Extending the Food Hygiene Rating Scheme** - It was clear that the Food Hygiene Rating Scheme had made a really positive impact in terms of raising public awareness and food hygiene standards in Cardiff. Businesses viewed a good Food Hygiene Rating Score as an asset while the public seemed to use the score as a determining factor when deciding where to eat. During the meeting Members explored the idea of placing Food Hygiene Rating Scores onto takeaway menus and websites. They were told that there is no current statutory requirement for this to happen at the moment, however, it is something that the Welsh Government had considered. Opinion as to whether Food Hygiene Rating Scores should be added to websites or takeaway menus was divided, with some Members taking the view that a link to the Food Standards website should be sufficient while others felt that a score on a menu or website was a far more transparent option. Either way the Committee believed that highlighting the score or how to access the score was important as it put the public in a better position to make an informed choice.
- **Targeted Food Hygiene Events** - Members were pleased that Shared Regulatory Services were running food hygiene events; in particular they were impressed that approximately 180 businesses had recently attended an event at the Principality Stadium. The Committee felt that this approach could be further developed to support some harder to reach food catering establishments by having targeted events in specific geographical areas, for example, the idea of running an event targeted at food businesses on City Road was suggested.

Cardiff's Taxi Services (3 October 2017)

The meeting on 3 October 2017 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's Taxi Services' to review the standards of taxi provision in the city. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the Shared Regulatory Service. The purposed of the report was:

- To provide Members with a briefing on the way in which Taxi Services in Cardiff currently operate, the challenges that they face and to consider where improvements can potentially be achieved.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- **Blocking Bus Lanes** – Some Members of the Committee were concerned by the frequency with which bus lanes were blocked by taxis in the city centre. Officers explained that taxis were allowed to use Cardiff's bus lanes and that dropping off and picking up is permitted, however, this had to be done within a 'reasonable' timescale and that using the bus lanes as extended layover spots or unofficial taxi ranks was not allowed. The Committee felt that the bus lanes need to be kept clear as unnecessary blockages delayed bus journeys and had an impact on Cardiff's 50:50 modal shift target. Members urged that the strongest possible enforcement action should be taken against persistent offenders with the hope that this would stress the message that the Council does not tolerate taxis blocking bus lanes.
- **Taxi Spot Checks** - The Committee strongly supported the use of regular taxi spot checks to ensure that licensing conditions and standards are followed in Cardiff. One of the Members stressed the importance of checking the individual's details against the actual vehicle and taxi driver licensing scheme to establish that they are an authorised driver. The Committee agreed with the idea of having a more thorough driver

validation check as a part of the spot check process – this they felt would help improve taxi safety and standards in the city.

- **Taxi Ranks** - The issue of taxi ranks and the impact that they have on the city centre was discussed at the meeting. The Members concluded that it was time to review the provision of taxi ranks in the city centre, and asked the Cabinet Member to undertake a taxi rank review.
- **Taxi Marshals** – Members welcomed the intention of the Cardiff Business Improvement District (BID) to fund the appointment of additional taxi marshals in the city centre. The Committee felt that this would enhance provision and improve Cardiff's taxi offer. The only concern that Members had was ensuring a consistent standard across the BID and Council funded staff so that the public receive a seamless and consistent service.
- **Common Taxi Policies** –Members were pleased to hear that the creation of Shared Regulatory Services had largely resulted in the standardisation of the taxi licensing processes across the Cardiff, Bridgend and Vale of Glamorgan. They felt that this was a very positive step forward and that standardisation was something that would only benefit taxi licensing standards across Wales as a whole.

PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

First Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (3 October 2017)

The meeting on 3 October 2017 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing: First Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report'. The reason for receiving the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of a Cabinet report titled 'First Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' that was later presented to Cabinet on Thursday 21 September 2017. Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report. The main comment was that the document was the first in a series of reports designed to measure the progress of Cardiff's Local Development Plan; as such the best that the report could do was identify a number of baseline values against future progress could be measured. Members noted the content of the report and agreed to undertake further scrutiny of the 'Second Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' due to be published in the autumn of 2018.

Draft Corporate Plan 2018 to 2021 & 2018/19 Draft Cabinet Budget proposals (14 February 2018)

The meeting on 14 February 2018 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2018 to 2021 & 2018/19 Draft Budget Proposals'. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment, Strategic Planning & Transport and Finance, Modernisation & Performance were invited to the meeting. They were supported by officers from the City Operations, Commercial & Collaborative Services and the Resources Directorate.

The letter sent after the meeting to the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation and Performance addressed the content of the whole meeting and made the following key points:

Corporate Overview

- The Committee was concerned at the increasing borrowing costs associated with the Capital Programme – it was explained at the meeting that interest payments could account for 16.5% of the Council's revenue budget by 2022/23. While Members supported the majority of the proposals contained in the Capital Programme they were concerned that the Council was not spending tomorrow's money today. At the same time they acknowledged that interest rates were exceptionally low at the time and so some of the Committee were of the view that it was a good time to borrow and invest. Members concluded that it would be prudent to review the Capital Programme to prioritise any essential projects.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals

2018/19 – Corporate Overview

- Members were pleased to see that £1.4 million had been included in the Capital Programme for the delivery of the Western Transport Bus Interchange. They agreed that the creation of a series of transport hubs for the city was essential to keep the city moving and that such development

would support the operation of the new integrated transport hub. The Committee supported the capital investment, but at the same time urged the Council to ensure that at least some of the satellite transport hubs were operational by the time the new integrated transport hub was completed.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2018/19 – Corporate Overview

- The Committee was concerned at the reduction in recycling income due to the global decline in prices. They agreed with the provision of the financial pressure bid for £523,000 to support the growth of dry recycling processing and to compensate for the reduction in income. Members understood that it presented a difficult challenge for the Council and commend the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from Commercial & Collaboration Services for taking positive steps to mitigate and solve the problem.

Coastal Risk Management Programme (6 March 2018)

The meeting on 6 March 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Coastal Risk Management Programme' due to be received at the Cabinet meeting on the 15 March 2018. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. The purposed of the report due to be received by Cabinet was:

- To provide a briefing to Cabinet on the current state of Cardiff's coastal defences and the Welsh Government Coastal Risk Management Programme;
- To seek Cabinet approval for the commitment to procure the detailed design and construction of the coastal defences valued at £11 million.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee supported the plan to improve coastal flood defences between Rover Way in the west and Lamby Way in the east. They felt that it was vital to ensure that the large number of homes and businesses in the area were properly protected against coastal erosion and future potential flood risks. They believed that working with Welsh Government to deliver the scheme was very positive and looked forward to future scrutiny of the plans for the next phase of the process.
- The Committee felt that it would be a very positive thing if the new coastal flood defence scheme could be designed to support wildlife in the area and allow for a range of leisure opportunities, for example, walking. They asked the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment to look at these options and do what he could to build them into the design process.

- A Member asked if sufficient modelling had been undertaken to assess the impact that creating the scheme would have on other nearby coastal areas. It was suggested that some modelling work had been carried out, and so Members asked for further details of any coastal modelling information that had been carried out for the proposed implementation of the scheme.

New Burial Space – Member Briefing Note (6 March 2018)

The meeting on 6 March 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'New Burial Space – Member Briefing Note'. This was in advance of a Cabinet paper titled 'New Burial Space' being received at the Cabinet meeting on the 15 March 2018. The purpose of the report due to be received by Cabinet was to seek Cabinet approval to develop an area of existing Council owned land North of the M4 on the A469 for new cemetery space. Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- Members of the Committee were supportive of the proposal to locate the new cemetery at Thornhill Farm and felt that its close proximity to the Thornhill Crematorium and the facilities that it offers made it a logical option.
- The Committee asked that before any work commenced on Phase 1 of the development an assessment was carried out to see if any long term savings could be achieved by delivering all of the required supporting infrastructure for the whole site at the outset.

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality – Welsh Government Direction (27 March 2018)

The meeting on 27 March 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality – Welsh Government Direction' due to be received at the Cabinet meeting on the 28 March 2018. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Strategic Planning & Environment and Social Care, Health & Well Being were invited to the meeting and supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. The purpose of the report to be received by Cabinet was:

- To note that the Council has received a legal direction from Welsh Government titled Environment Act 1995 (feasibility study for Nitrogen Dioxide Compliance) Air Quality Direction 2018;
- To enable Cabinet to approve the undertaking of a feasibility study as required by the legal direction from Welsh Government;
- To approve the procurement of a specialist consultant to undertake the feasibility study to identify options for improving air quality and delivering compliance with the legal limits for nitrogen dioxide in Cardiff.

Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- **DEFRA Modelling Data** - During the meeting it was explained that modelling undertaken by DEFRA indicated that Cardiff would be non-compliant beyond 2023 in terms of achieving the EU air quality directive limits; the potential breaches were identified along sections of the A48 and A4232. The Committee acknowledge the importance of the feasibility study and its role in verifying the DEFRA modelled air quality results, and asked for confirmation of the DEFRA results for both sites along with details of when the exercise was undertaken, the data sets used to simulate traffic flows and a breakdown of all other assumptions applied to the calculation.

- **Feasibility Study & Procurement Timescales** - Members were concerned about the exceptionally tight timescales placed upon the Council for delivering the feasibility study and indeed identifying a plan to achieve air quality compliance in 'the shortest possible time'. They felt that completing the feasibility study by the 30 September was a significant challenge, particularly given that several comparable cities had taken in excess of two years to complete the same task. Concerns were raised that the short timescale might mean that the exercise was rushed to the detriment of achieving the best outcome for Cardiff, and that the formal procurement of an air quality consultant had yet to start. The Committee asked for assurance that the short timescale for delivering the feasibility study would not prevent the Council from achieving the best outcome for Cardiff and that the time taken to procure a specialist air quality consultant has been built into the six month window for delivering the feasibility study in Cardiff.
- **Regional Collaboration** - The Committee welcomed the comments of the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport in relation to working with neighbouring local authorities to identify the best solutions for dealing with Cardiff's air quality challenges, and in achieving the widest possible audience for the consultation exercise supporting 'Cardiff's Transport & Clean Air Green Paper'.
- **Low Emission / Sustainable Fuels** – The Committee welcomed the commitment made by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment in terms of developing the use of low emission / sustainable fuels in Cardiff. They felt that the use of low emission vehicles and sustainable fuel sources would be a major contributing factor in improving Cardiff's air quality. They encouraged the Council to be bold in its approach and consider all of the potential solutions available, for example, electric and hydrogen powered vehicles.

- **Electricity Supply** – Several of the Members were concerned at the comment made about the available supply of electricity in Cardiff being potentially insufficient to meet the future demand created by the growth of electric vehicles. They asked for details of the current electricity supply available to Cardiff; estimates for the increase in electric vehicles in the city and the projected increase in demand for electricity created by the new electric vehicles.
- **Finances** – The Committee welcomed the positive financial statement made in the letter from the Minister for Environment. They were reassured to hear that the Welsh Government would be supporting the Council to address the challenge and that they had agreed to support the funding for the feasibility study and implementation of the scheme to be identified for improving Cardiff's air quality.
- **Cardiff's Transport & Clean Air Green Paper** – Members welcomed 'Cardiff's Transport & Clean Air Green Paper' and the consultation exercise to support the piece of work. They agreed that it was well constructed and identified a number of important ideas that are essential for transforming Cardiff into a modern sustainable travel city. The Committee stressed that timescales for achieving air quality compliance were in very short and some of the more significant projects (for example, the Metro) would be delivered outside of this period. Given the timescales and resources available Members emphasised the importance of delivering as many of the short term measures within the Council's control as quickly as possible, for example, continued focus on 20 mph zones and parking restriction measures. They also acknowledged the need for any major transport infrastructure projects due for completion within this timescale to be delivered on time.

Cardiff District Heat Network (17 April 2017)

The meeting on 17 April 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff District Heat Network' in advance of the proposal being considered by Cabinet on the 19 April 2018. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report due to be received by Cabinet was:

- To report the outcome of a Detailed Feasibility Study on District Heat Networks in Cardiff;
- To present the Outline Business Case (OBC) for the proposed Cardiff Heat Network (CHN) recommended in this study;
- To seek authority to commence with the next steps of the project including grant applications and the development of a Final Business Case (FBC) for further consideration by the Cabinet;
- To signal a future Council Capital Bid for £4m of Public Works Loan Board Invest to Save borrowing for the CHN, subject to other funding confirmation and approval of a Full Business Case.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee was content with the proposals contained within the Outline Business Case for Cardiff's District Heat Network. Members noted that the commercial case for Phase 1 of the scheme was financially tight based on the assumption of only supplying heat to public sector providers, with public sector grants being essential to make the scheme viable.
- Members noted the 'Key Milestones' slide in the presentation that contained a long list of actions that will need to be achieved to deliver the Final Business Case and award of the DBOM contract. They asked if the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment would keep

the Committee informed on the progress of the project so that future scrutiny could be built into the Environmental Scrutiny Committee work programme.

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Funding the New Bus Transport Interchange (18 July 2017)

Members recognised the importance to residents, commuters, visitors, employers and businesses of having a high quality bus transport interchange in place as soon as possible. Committee time was made available to undertake regular scrutiny of proposals as these came forward throughout 2017-18. In all, the Environmental Scrutiny Committee undertook two separate joint scrutinies with the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee on proposals for delivering a new Cardiff Bus Station. These focused on exploring the following with Councillor Russell Goodway – Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and senior officers: funding mechanisms, the fit with neighbouring regeneration proposals for Central Square, Central Train Station and Central Quay; risk management; and deliverability.

Pre-Decision Scrutiny – July 2017 - The Committee held a joint meeting with the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee, to carry out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet on the bus station. At the meeting, Members explored issues relating to the financing of the bus station, including: financial assumptions; how risks to the Council were addressed and mitigated; the timeline for delivering the bus station; and the recommendations to Cabinet.

Following the meeting, the Chair wrote to convey the joint Committee's support for the recommendations to Cabinet in terms of a market driven approach to determining the end use of the space above the bus station. Members asked to be kept informed of progress with a bid to Welsh Government for assistance in meeting technical fit out and highway improvements. Members also highlighted the need to ensure due diligence checks are applied to ensure robust financial modelling and consideration of legal advice.

Councillor Goodway responded to the Chair's letter, stating that the administration would *'seek to achieve the best possible return on the council's investment to ensure that we can deliver the best possible facility but also*

taking account of the timescales we need to work to if we are to deliver the facility in an acceptable timeframe'. Councillor Goodway also stated that he would ensure that council officials adopt a robust approach to ensure due diligence.

Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021 (15 May 2018)

The meeting on 15 May 2018 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021' in advance of the proposal being considered by Cabinet on the 17 May 2018. The Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to highlight the process and consultation approach being followed by the Council in developing Cardiff's new Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021 and to consider the following proposals:

- The expansion of the provision of wheeled bins in the city;
- Proposed changes to Household Waste Recycling Centre (HWRC) education stations;
- A pilot scheme for the collection of domestic glass waste for recycling, which is separate to other household waste collections.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- Members asked for details of the wheeled bin expansion after the process of consulting with the affected local ward councillors had taken place.
- The Committee was supportive of the Council working with Welsh Government to help pilot some of the new changes resulting from the new Environment Act for Wales that would affect the commercial waste industry in Wales.
- The Committee welcomed the idea of developing local processing plants to deal with the recyclate produced in the South East Wales region. This they felt would help improve 'closed loop recycling' and mitigate the impacts of the constantly fluctuating recyclate market.

- During the municipal year it was noted that a third Household Waste Recycling Centre was proposed for the north of Cardiff and that £3 million had been allocated to the capital budget to support the delivery of the scheme in the next three years. Members asked for assurance that the proposal still stood, confirmation of the current anticipated timescale and details of any potential sites.
- Members welcomed the consultation exercise to support the development of the 'Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021'. They asked for regular Committee updates so that they could contribute to the exercise where they felt it was appropriate.

RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and suggest any new issues that may be of interest to the Committee. The following items have been identified during 2017/18 as suitable items for discussion during the 2018/19 work programming process:

- New Bus Transport Interchange
- Cabinet Response to Improving Cardiff's Air Quality
- Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2019/20
- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2018/19 & Business Plan 2019/20
- Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report
- Draft Budget Proposals 2019/20
- Lamby Way Solar Farm
- Cardiff District Heat Network
- Cardiff's Clean Air Strategy
- Cardiff's Cycling Strategy
- Paving Report - Section 106 Local Infrastructure Proposal Lists
- Planning, Transport & Environment Digitalisation
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy – 2018 to 2021

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

© 2018 City and County of Cardiff