

**s c r u t i n y**



---

# **A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee**

## **Annual Report 2016 – 2017**

**March 2017**



**City and County of Cardiff**

## ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Paul Mitchell  
(Chairperson)



Councillor Gareth Aubrey



Councillor Tariq Awan



Councillor Elizabeth Clark



Councillor Chris Davis



Councillor Gavin Hill - John



Councillor Keith Jones



Councillor Darren Williams

At the start of the municipal year Councillors Chris Lomax and Susan White were members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. During the municipal year Councillor Lomax sadly passed away, and Councillor White resigned her post as a councillor. They were replaced by Councillors Tariq Awan and Keith Jones in January 2017.

## CHAIR'S FOREWORD

2016/17 has been another busy year for Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee. As has been the case for the last four years the ongoing budgetary reductions have continued to place pressures on service delivery throughout the organisation and within its terms of reference the Environmental Scrutiny Committee has done its best to review, comment on and support a wide range of Council proposals.

During the year the Committee scrutinised a range of current and future proposals that will impact significantly on the city of Cardiff, these included Cardiff's Transport Strategy, Cardiff's Cycling Strategy, Cardiff's Public Convenience Strategy, the proposals for the Cardiff Central Transport Hub, Pavement & Footway Maintenance and Litter Management.

In particular I would like to highlight two areas of work; the first has contributed to the improvement of Council services and the second that I hope will drive environmental improvements across the South East Wales River Basin.

In June 2016 the Committee jointly reviewed the Infrastructure Services Full Business case with the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee. This was in effect the conclusion to a very long and detailed two year scrutiny exercise that helped review the way forward for a wide range of outdoor services in Cardiff. While there was a difference in opinion around the chosen service delivery model (we favoured the Public Public Joint Venture Model), we were able to recommend a range of essential service delivery characteristics that have been adopted by the newly formed Commercial & Collaborative Services and Neighbourhood Services. I am pleased to say that since last summer these services have gone from strength to strength, but the financial challenges remain daunting.

During early 2016 a number of local anglers drew my attention to the plight of the River Ely; in recent years problems like littering and pollution have had a very negative environmental impact on this water course resulting in Natural Resources Wales classifying sections of the river as 'poor'. To respond to this the Committee scrutinised the issue at its March meeting before commissioning a task & finish exercise titled Restore Our Rivers to look into the matter. In doing this, we co-opted the support of key partners including Dwr Cymru / Welsh Water, Natural Resources Wales, Keep Wales Tidy, South East Wales Rivers Trust, Cardiff Rivers Group, Glamorgan Anglers and Groundwork Wales. The group worked closely to measure the problems facing the South East River Basin as a whole and considered a range of prevention, improvement, educational and regional opportunities that they hoped would drive improvements in our local watercourses. The exercise concluded with a report that identified 140 key findings and made 20 recommendations designed to improve the quality of our local rivers.

The Restore Our Rivers task & finish exercise has in my mind proved the value of partnership working. As a group we have collectively endorsed the whole of catchment management approach; integrated the communications approach across the partnership to help amplify a collective message; created the foundations of a vital 'South East Wales River Basin Working Group'; advocated additional support for volunteer groups working and delivered a detailed survey of the whole River Ely catchment. The survey results will in the next few months be used to inform a series of river quality improvement events which are as I write being planned for the spring of 2017. As the City Region develops, I hope my proposal for a Regional Environmental Group will be accepted as the way forward.

As this five year election term comes to an end I would like to thank all of the Members and officers who have supported the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. We have undertaken a huge amount of work and I think, played our part in improving Cardiff as a place to live. Ballot box willing, I hope to

return in 2017/18 to help the Council address what I am sure will be a fresh set of environmental and financial challenges.



**Councillor Paul Mitchell, Chairperson  
Environmental Scrutiny Committee  
March 2017**

## INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2016/17. Between June 2016 and March 2017 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2016/17 examples included:
  - Restore Our Rivers Task & Finish Exercise – Verbal Update – 4 October 2016.
  - Restore Our Rivers Task & Finish Exercise.
  - Findings of the short task & finish exercise titled 'Tidal Lagoon' – 15 November 2016.
  - Restore Our Rivers – Draft Task & Finish Report – 10 January 2017.
  - Management of Section 106 Funding for the Development of Community Projects.
  - Joint Scrutiny: Environmental Scrutiny Committee and Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee – Cardiff Central Transport Hub – 2016/17.
  
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. During 2015/16 examples included:
  - Infrastructure Services – Full Business Case – 6 June 2016.

- Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016 – 6 September 2016.
  - Draft Cycling Strategy & Integrated Network Map – 10 January 2017.
  - Draft Corporate Plan 2017 – 2019 & 2017/18 Draft Cabinet Budget Proposals – 14 February 2017.
  - Cardiff's Transport Strategy – 14 June 2016.
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2015/16 examples included:
    - City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17 – 6 September 2016.
    - Draft 2016 City of Cardiff Air Quality Progress Report – 6 September 2016.
    - Performance Reporting – Quarter 2 2016/17 – 15 November 2016.
    - Performance Reporting – Quarter 3 2016/17 – 7 March 2017.
- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject which has environmental implications to the Council and the City. During 2015/16 examples included:
    - Street Lighting – Member Briefing – 14 June 2016.
    - Cardiff's Energy Prospectus – Member Update – 12 July 2016.
    - Recycling & Waste Restricting Programme – One Year Update – 4 October 2016.
    - Pavement & Footway Maintenance in Cardiff – 4 October 2016.
    - Neighbourhood Services – Member Update – 15 November 2016.
    - Planning Service – Member Update – 6 December 2016.
    - Commercial & Collaboration Services – Progress Update – 10 January 2017.
    - Managing Litter in Cardiff – 15 November 2016.

- **Call In Meeting** - Where the Committee considers a request made by a non-Executive Member to review a recent Executive decision on a specific subject which has environmental implications to the Council and the City. During 2016/17 examples included:
  - Cardiff West Transport Interchange – Consideration of Called – In Cabinet Decision CAB/16/38 – 8 February 2017.

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held 12 committee meetings and wrote 20 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. This included one joint meeting.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.



## TASK AND FINISH INQUIRIES

### **Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Restore Our Rivers Task & Finish Exercise – August 2016 to January 2017**

---

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee undertook a task & finish exercise titled 'Restore Our Rivers' in partnership with the following co-opted partners:

- Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water;
- Natural Resources Wales;
- Cardiff Rivers Group;
- Glamorgan Anglers;
- Keep Wales Tidy;
- South East Wales River Trust;
- Groundwork Wales.

The inquiry ran from August 2016 to January 2017 and considered a range of options and initiatives for improving the quality of rivers and water courses in Cardiff and the wider South East Wales River Basin. The terms of reference for the scrutiny exercise were:

*The collaborative task & finish working group will consider, evaluate and address the current problems facing Cardiff's rivers and watercourses. In doing so the exercise will develop a series of work packages, which will review the following areas:*

- *Measurement and benchmarking of the current condition of Cardiff's rivers and watercourses;*
- *Prevention opportunities which can be applied to Cardiff's rivers and watercourses;*
- *Educational opportunities which can be applied to Cardiff's rivers and watercourses;*

- *Improvement opportunities which can be applied to Cardiff's rivers and watercourses;*
- *Regional opportunities which can be applied to the rivers and courses of the wider South East Wales River Basin.*

*In doing this the task & finish working group will explore best practice, receive witness contributions and access research resources from a wide range of sources. The task & finish exercise will address each of the five work package themes individually and a bespoke terms of reference will be created for each of the work packages.*

*The task & finish exercise will aim to identify a series of key findings and recommendations for each of the five work packages; these will be recorded in this report which will upon conclusion be submitted to the to the Welsh Government Cabinet Secretary for Environment and Rural Affairs; Cardiff Council's Cabinet Member for the Environment and the decision making body of each of the partner organisations who have provided representatives to support the collaborative task & finish working group. A copy of the report will be made available to other interested parties.*

*The collaborative task & finish working group will include Elected Members from Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee and co-opt appointed representatives from the Cardiff Rivers Group; Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water; Glamorgan Anglers; Keep Wales Tidy; Natural Resources Wales and the South East Wales Rivers Trust.*

In reviewing the various options the group drew upon a number of information sources. From this body of evidence the Members drew 140 key findings and 20 recommendations. The main recommendations were:

- **Recommendation 3** - Improving the water quality of the rivers in Cardiff involves taking a whole river catchment approach and not just addressing specific problems in Cardiff. As a consequence, the partners involved with the task & finish exercise need to work together to gain the support of all of the local authorities within the South East Wales River Basin, i.e. Cardiff,

the Vale of Glamorgan, Rhondda Cynon Taff, Merthyr Tydfil and Caerphilly. Only by working across the whole South East Wales River Basin can real long term improvements be achieved. Working in this type of collaborative way would help build connections and enhance the multi-agency working approach.

- **Recommendation 5** - The Swansea Loose Connections Project is an excellent example of how partnership work can improve water quality. Surveying a river system to identify misconnections and then addressing the problems at source is a very effective way to achieve quick improvements in water quality. The partners involved with the task & finish exercise should in part look to copy this approach and conduct a river survey to identify any misconnection issues. Should any misconnections be identified then appropriate action should be taken to address the problem.
  
- **Recommendation 8** - Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water and Natural Resources Wales felt that working closely with local authority environmental health services was a highly effective way of target and deal with misconnections and sewer abuse. The partners involved with the task & finish exercise agreed with this approach. As a consequence, they would like Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water, Natural Resources Wales and the environmental health teams of the five local authority areas to discuss the feasibility of:
  - Carrying out a check to ensure that all food establishments have grease / fat traps and enzyme dosing systems in place – they currently only check to see if used oil is collected and taken away;
  
  - Establishing closer working links between Environmental Health Officers and Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water Sewer Network Abuse Protection Technicians – in particular around fat oil and grease issues where the Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water officers are able to provide valuable support;

- Where the need arises, Environmental Health Officers and Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water Sewer Network Abuse Protection Technicians carry out joint inspections;
  - Environmental Health Officers carrying Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water 'Let's Stop the Block' literature so that they can provide copies to food establishments where they deem appropriate;
  - When there is a change of premises use to a class A3 food establishment, the occupants are made aware of their responsibilities in terms of fat, oil and grease management;
  - Issuing all food establishments with free fat funnels to help increase the recycling of fat, oil and grease.
- **Recommendation 9** - The partners involved with the task & finish exercise agreed with the need to undertake a survey and clean of the River Ely. This exercise should be project managed by Keep Wales Tidy with support being provided by the partner groups associated with the task & finish exercise. Keep Wales Tidy should explore a range of funding options to support this work and engage with volunteer groups to deliver a survey and series of prioritised tasks. The exercise should involve a survey, litter picks, river blockage removals, habitat management work, invasive species management and educational initiatives. The river survey should take place in January / February 2017 and the results from this work should then be used to prioritise tasks for river clean events, which should take place in spring 2017.
  - **Recommendation 13** - During the task & finish exercise 14 awareness raising campaigns and educational promotions were identified which the group felt could provide additional benefits / support to rivers and watercourses in the South East Wales River Basin. These were:
    - The Yellow Fish Campaign;

- The Hydro Power & Schools Campaign;
- The Salmon Homecoming Project;
- The Eel Programme;
- The Natural Resources Wales 'Healthy Rivers Campaign';
- The Capital Investment Campaign;
- The 'Let's Stop the Block' Campaign;
- The 'Clean Water Campaign';
- The KWT 'Cardiff Taff Tidy';
- The Ely top to toe survey and river clean;
- The Natural Resources Wales 'Slurry Pollution Campaign';
- The 'See it – Report it – Stop it' campaign;
- The 'Natural Resources Wales' programme;
- The 'Flush & Forget' campaign.

All of the task & finish partner organisations and the five local authorities from within the South East Wales River Basin should work together to amplify the key messages of these and other new campaigns across the whole area using a combined and well-structured communications approach, for example, if Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water is looking to spread the message of the 'Let's Stop the Block' campaign then they should not do it in isolation. Instead they should pass the message onto all of the other partner groups for communication across a wide range of distribution channels, for example, social media, internal briefings & messages, websites, press releases etc.

- **Recommendation 15** - During the task & finish exercise it became clear that a number of different groups and organisations were promoting a diverse range of campaigns and educational initiatives aimed at improving the health of our rivers and watercourses. While all of this work was viewed as positive there was no single point to gather, distribute and effectively amplify the messages across the whole South East Wales River Basin. As a result, the task & finish exercise recommends that a central website is created to act as a single point of contact for people and groups interested in improving the health of our rivers and watercourses. To

ensure that the site website works effectively key features of the site should include:

- The site should act as a single point of contact to store or signpost visitors to the relevant information or messages provided by each of the partner organisations;
  - When a partner organisation posts a new message or piece of information it should trigger an automatic notification to the partner organisations informing them of the new posting. This would then allow the partner organisations to circulate the message via their communications function;
  - That one partner should probably have responsibility for hosting the site, however, all partners should have the ability to upload or post any new information onto the site;
  - That an information sharing protocol should be established between the partners - any new organisations joining the partnership should also be bound to this information sharing protocol;
  - That all legalities of establishing such a partnership website should be explored and understood at the outset;
  - For practical purposes such a system would need to be cost effective, simple and easy to use.
- **Recommendation 17** - Local authorities and the partner organisations associated with the task & finish exercise have in recent years worked well with volunteer groups to deliver a large number of projects aimed at improving local rivers and enhancing the wider natural environment. The task group endorses this work and recommends that even more is done to increase the good work that they deliver. Examples of additional support include:

- The development of a list of river improvement and environmental habitat improvement projects which as volunteer and supporting resources become available could be allocated to a suitable group, i.e. creating a situation where volunteer groups can be signposted to appropriate projects. Potential projects could be identified from the results of the River Ely survey which is scheduled for January / February 2017. The identified projects could be collated into a river improvement based action plan.
  
- Publicising the good work of the volunteer groups through the communications functions of the partner organisations of the task & finish exercise. This would help raise the profile of the excellent work that they deliver and potentially encourage other people to follow their example and become volunteers.
  
- Helping the volunteer groups form links with businesses and other organisations able to provide additional support for the work that they undertake. This it is felt would help improve partnership working in this area.
  
- Helping to signpost the volunteer groups towards potential funding sources to help fund the important work that they undertake.
  
- Creating a group or body to provide the facilitation role for river based improvement work in the South East Wales River Basin. They could develop project ideas and oversee the resources available before arranging for the work to be delegated to the volunteer and other groups.
  
- **Recommendation 20** - A South East Wales River Basin working group should be created to oversee the delivery of river and watercourse improvements. The task & finish exercise partners recommend that the group should:

- Coordinate shared resources, skills and knowledge from across the whole South East Wales River Basin;
- Hold a documented summary on the condition of the rivers and watercourses across the whole South East Wales River Basin;
- Monitor and document changes across the rivers and watercourses of the South East Wales River Basin;
- Coordinate the development of an action plan which would set out work priorities required to drive improvement across the South East Wales River Basin;
- Provide a facilitation and allocation role for South East Wales River Basin action plan;
- Identify funding sources that can be accessed by group members (or associated stakeholders) to undertake work;
- Include representation from the five local authorities (Cardiff, the Vale of Glamorgan, Rhondda Cynon Taff, Caerphilly & Merthyr Tydfil) and significant stakeholders (Natural Resources Wales; Dŵr Cymru / Welsh Water; Keep Wales Tidy; South East Wales Rivers Trust; Groundwork Wales; key volunteer groups; key river user groups; The Wildlife Trust & key community groups).
- Meet on a quarterly basis, keep operational costs to a minimum and rely on contributions in kind (for example, accommodation and staff costs).

During the period of the Restore Our Rivers Task & Finish Exercise regular updates were provided to the Committee around the progress of the inquiry, for example, a verbal update was provided at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting on the 4 October 2016. The



draft report titled 'Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Restore Our Rivers' was considered and approved for publication at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee on the 10 January 2017.

It hoped that during the 2017/18 Municipal Year a South East Wales River Basin Working Group will be created by the Council, the co-opted partner organisations and other relevant parties to drive forward the recommendations of the Inquiry.

## **Tidal Lagoon Short Task & Finish Exercise**

### **(15 November 2016)**

---

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee Short Task & Finish Exercise titled 'Tidal Lagoon' took place on 15 November 2016. Its aim was to provide Members with the opportunity to consider potential proposals for the development of a tidal lagoon in an area of the Severn estuary between Cardiff and Newport. The terms of reference included receiving:

- *An outline summary of the potential project proposals for the development of a tidal lagoon;*
- *An update on the potential proposals for the development of a tidal lagoon;*
- *A briefing on the current status of the Hendry Review and the impact that this may have on the development of tidal power locally and across the United Kingdom;*
- *An explanation of the planning process that would be required for the development of a tidal lagoon;*
- *The potential opportunities and issues facing the development of a tidal lagoon;*
- *The next steps facing the potential development of a tidal lagoon.*

After the meeting a letter was sent from the Chair of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee to the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability that made the following comments and recommendations:

- The Members acknowledged the potential significance and scale of the tidal lagoon infrastructure project. They understood that the impact of such a project could be vast and hugely complex and acknowledged that the Council was potentially facing a huge knowledge gap on matters that, in the event of the project progressing, would need to be overcome. They agreed with the view put forward that gaining a good understanding of all issues involved with the project was essential for getting the best deal for Cardiff citizens.

- Members acknowledged that, despite any concerns that they might have, was just an outline proposal. It relied heavily upon a favourable outcome from the Hendry Review and then securing a suitable financial proposal to deliver a multi billion pound project. The task group believed that the best way forward would be to:
  - Await the outcome of the Hendry Review and then when provided to quickly arrange a meeting to discuss the findings of the review (whatever the outcome) and assess what this meant for Cardiff.
  - Should the outcome be favourable towards delivering the tidal lagoon project then the Members believed that scrutiny and the Council should hold a scoping event to identify and map all of the issues that a project of this scale would inevitably create.
  - In principle the Members agreed with the idea of developing some form of joint scrutiny with Newport City Council and any other public bodies with a significant interest in the development of the tidal lagoon. However, before looking to put any such arrangements in place it would seem prudent to reflect on the outcome of the Hendry Review and any subsequent Cardiff tidal lagoon scoping exercise.
  - Members noted and agreed with the comments made by the Head of Planning that additional planning resources would need to be made available to support a project of this scale. Equally the Members felt that scrutiny would require additional support to properly scrutinise a project of this type and scale.

The Cabinet agreed to await the outcome of the Hendry Review and use the information from the task and finish letter to inform its future work on the Tidal Lagoon.

## **Management of Section 106 Contributions**

### **Task and Finish Exercise**

---

This Environmental Scrutiny Committee inquiry started in late February 2016 and a draft version of the report was presented at the Committee meeting on 7 March 2017. It evaluates the process involved around the use of Section 106 contributions (and other relevant planning obligations) in the development of community projects. In particular it focuses on:

- the regulations governing the types of projects that can be funded;
- how Section 106 contributions (and other planning obligations) are managed;
- the consultation and engagement which takes place between councillors, officers and the public;
- the impact of the Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations on the Section 106 funding process;
- how community projects are identified through the Section 106 process; and
- examples of good practice in this area.

## **Joint Scrutiny: Environmental Scrutiny Committee and Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee – Cardiff Central Transport Hub – 2016/17**

---

As part of their 2014 – 15 work programmes, the Environmental and Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committees agreed to establish a joint task and finish inquiry focussed on arrangements for the new Central Transportation Hub. It was agreed that the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee would take the lead on this work, given the existing commitments of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee.

In 2014 – 15, given the tight timescales prior to a Cabinet decision it was deemed unlikely that Scrutiny could provide the full rigour of a task and finish Inquiry within the time available. As such, it was agreed that a series of individual meetings on specific themes would be arranged, with letters and recommendations submitted following each meeting.

Three meetings of this inquiry were held as part of the 2014 – 15 work programme, and a further three meetings were held as part of the 2015 – 16 work programme. A seventh meeting of this inquiry was held in September 2016. A summary of this meeting and the correspondence between the Inquiry Members and Cabinet Member is given below.

### **Meeting 7 – Pre-decision Scrutiny – Design Scheme and Funding Options (22 September 2016)**

At this meeting Members were given an overview of the current position with regard to the design scheme for the transport interchange building, an outline of progress made to date and the future funding options to be considered by the Council. Cllr Rod McKerlich, Chair of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member - Transport, Planning & Sustainability to:

- Note that a substantial change to the design proposals was for car parking spaces to be provided above ground rather than below. The rationale behind this decision was the additional cost and time it would take to build underground parking, and with this in mind Members welcomed the change.
- Note Members' confidence that the transport interchange element of the building will be delivered and will have the capacity to cope with the required bus traffic through the city centre – regardless of changes to the upper floors of the building.
- Note that Members were pleased consideration is being given to opportunities that could generate income for the Council and their awareness that these options come with varied levels of risk.
- Highlight the importance of potential risks and rewards being fully quantified in order for the right decision to be made for Cardiff.
- Endorse the report and recognise the need for the recommendations being made, namely to proceed with a planning application based on the current design scheme, to undertake a detailed business case to establish a preferred funding approach and to underwrite the second phase of design costs.

The response received from the Cabinet Member - Transport, Planning & Sustainability stated that:

- He was grateful for the continued support and feedback of Scrutiny and confirmed that points raised in relation to potential risk associated with financial arrangements would be noted.

- A future Cabinet decision would be needed on the detailed business case in early 2017 and confirming Scrutiny would be offered the opportunity to consider the details of the report.

## PRE DECISION

### **Joint Scrutiny: Environmental Scrutiny Committee and Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee – Pre-Decision of the Infrastructure Services – Full Business Case (6 June 2016)**

The meeting on 6 June 2016 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee and the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to jointly scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision of the Infrastructure Services – Full Business Case'. The Cabinet Members for the Environment and Corporate Support & Performance were invited to the meeting, supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Discussion prompted questions and comments that were put into a letter sent to the Cabinet Members. The key points made in the letter were:

- The Committee felt that future emphasis should focus on monitoring of the performance and delivery of the successful Modified In House model. To support this Members made the following performance monitoring suggestions:
  - Members wanted to scrutinise the new performance measures for the new service at the earliest possible opportunity. They felt that the new performance monitoring package should focus on key areas including the reduction in operating cost; net profit from income generated; customer baseline information and monitored performance against the established action plan.
  - The Members asked for the new performance measures, business plans and action plans to clearly link back to the strategic objectives set out in the project.



- The Committee agreed that the progress of the Modified In House approach needed to be properly monitored on a regular basis to ensure that savings and improvements were delivered. Reviewing progress on an annual basis, for example, would not be sufficient due to the magnitude of the change required and the fact that delivery failures around specific key enablers (for example, the Fleet Management Software and other ICT projects) could significantly hold back project success. It was felt that receiving monitoring reports on a quarterly basis was appropriate – this would tie in with the Council’s quarterly performance reporting structure.
  - Members recommended that the clusters and individual services within the ‘Commercial & Collaboration’ programme needed to be individually reported against and not simply monitored as a part of a wider directorate context.
  - The Committee were concerned that the preparation of the Modified In House business plan 2017 to 2021 would not start until September 2016 with an approval date of January 2017. Members felt that business plans should have been made available alongside the Infrastructure Services Full Business Case to clearly identify a way forward for the new Modified In House approach.
- The Committee remained concerned at the speed of implementation of the new fleet management software for Fleet Services. For the past two years scrutiny through various formats had repeatedly stressed the need to introduce a fleet management system into Central Transport Services.
- Members acknowledged the importance of the ICT projects being developed with the support of Enterprise Architecture, for example, mobile scheduling, mobile working devices and rostering software. The Committee asked for regular updates over the next 10 months to ensure that these important ICT projects remain on track to give the Modified In House approach the best chance of success.

## **Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016 (6 September 2016)**

---

The meeting on 6 September 2016 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff Council Public Convenience Outline Strategy 2016'. The Cabinet Member for the Environment was invited to the meeting and he was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate.

Discussion prompted questions and comments which were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member for the Environment. The key points made in the letter were:

- The Committee agreed with the importance of signposting the location of toilets in Cardiff to the public. They felt that the use of established 'third party apps' was a very effective and practical way of communicating this information.
- Members were concerned about the problem of urinating in public (particularly in the city centre). During the way forward the Committee discussed what could be done to better manage this problem and in doing so they suggested that the Council should initiate a 'go before you go' campaign to target public houses, restaurants and other licenced premises. Such a campaign would be designed to remind the people of the importance of visiting the toilet before leaving the establishment and reduce the number of incidents of urinating in public.
- In addition to this they asked that the Council explored the option of issuing penalty charge notices against those urinating in public places.

## **Draft Cycling Strategy & Integrated Network Map (10 January 2017)**

---

The meeting on 10 January 2017 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Draft Cycling Strategy & Integrated Network Map'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting, supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee welcomed the creation of a Cardiff Cycling Strategy stating that achieving a 50:50 modal split by 2026 was important for maintaining the quality of life of Cardiff residents. They also felt that the 'Draft Cardiff Cycling Strategy' and 'Integrated Network Map' were positive documents because they:
  - Set out a series of ambitious targets;
  - Provided a defined vision and series of actions to improve Cardiff's cycling infrastructure;
  - Identified the trends that need to be addressed;
  - Documented Cardiff's current and proposed cycling infrastructure;
  - Provided sustainable transport links between key parts of the city and strategic development sites.
  
- The 'Cardiff Draft Cycling Strategy 2016 to 2026' explained that the Council only spends £3.84 per resident per annum on cycling – this was very low when compared to cities like Amsterdam and Copenhagen who spend approximately £18 per resident per annum. The Committee felt that a relatively small per resident increase in cycling investment would produce significant health benefits, which in the medium term would help reduce other financial pressures facing the Council and health service.

## **Draft Corporate Plan 2017 to 2019 & 2017/18 Draft Cabinet Budget proposals (14 February 2017)**

---

The meeting on 14 February 2017 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2017 to 2019 & 2017/18 Draft Budget Proposals'. The Cabinet Members for the Environment; Transport, Planning & Sustainability; and Corporate Services & Performance were invited to the meeting. They were supported by officers from the City Operations, Commercial & Collaborative Services and the Resources Directorate.

The three letters sent after the meeting to the Cabinet Member for the Environment; the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability and the Cabinet Member for Corporate Services & Performance made the following key points:

### **Letter to the Cabinet Member for the Environment**

#### **City Operations Directorate**

- The Committee welcomed the additional £350,000 allocated towards the 'Intensive Cleansing Initiative' financial pressures bid and the nine new jobs that this created. They understood that much of the money would be directed towards cleansing in and around the city centre; however, felt that at least some of the funding needed to benefit the other wards of the city. As a consequence they asked how the extra money would be used to support cleansing outside of the city centre and if additional resources would be put in place to fund a liaison officer to work with retailers (particularly those in district shopping centres) in the city.
- The Committee were encouraged to hear that the Neighbourhood Services enforcement figures had increased by 75% in the quarter 3 of 2016/17.

## **Commercial & Collaborative Services**

- The Committee were concerned that the reduction of £468,000 in the Welsh Government 'Single Revenue Grant (Environment)' had effectively forced the Council to plug this funding gap through a financial pressures bid. Members asked for more lobbying of the Welsh Government to ensure the 'Single Revenue Grant (Environment)' was not further eroded.
- The Committee supported the additional £218,000 allocated towards a new 'Recycling & Re-use Centre' as the result of a financial pressures bid.

## **Letter to the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability**

- Members supported the idea of developing further 20 mph zones across Cardiff and welcomed the additional £200,000 allocated towards such schemes through the Financial Resilience Mechanism.
- The Committee welcomed the additional funds allocated from the Financial Resilience Mechanism towards improvements of the highway asset, for example, the £540,000 for highway & footway reconstruction and the £320,000 for continued targeted highway improvement across the city.
- Members felt that the introduction of 'parking sensor apps' was an exciting new development which illustrated the Council's appetite to embrace new technology to help better manage parking and traffic congestion.

## **Letter to the Cabinet Member for Corporate Services & Performance**

- Members felt that the budget consultation process had improved during 2016/17; in particular they were pleased to see that over 6,500 people had taken part in the exercise. However, they felt that there was scope for further improvement and recommended that the Council should review the 2016/17 process and compare it against the consultation work undertaken by other local authorities.

- Members noted the Council's commitment to paying of the voluntary living wage and the efforts it had made to encourage partners and contractors to do the same.
- The Committee understood that the Council is limited in what it can do to change the one-year financial settlement process; however, they supported any lobbying efforts that the Council could make to attempt to extend the financial planning window, for example, increasing this to a three year payment cycle.

## **Cardiff's Transport Strategy (14 June 2016)**

---

At their meeting on 14 June 2016 the Committee scrutinised and commented on an item titled 'Cardiff's Transport Strategy'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting, supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Following the meeting the Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member, making the following key points:

- The Committee wanted to see a commitment to establishing a 'circle line' around Cardiff as a part of the South Wales Metro proposals. In particular they felt that developing a link between Coryton and Radyr would be a logical step which would help complete a natural circle route for the city.
- The meeting discussed the importance of securing any pieces of land which were vital for protecting any heavy and / or light alignment points; this approach it was felt should make the longer term development of the South Wales Metro much easier and cheaper. The Committee stressed the importance of establishing a suitable land purchase compensation scheme at the first possible opportunity to support this process.

- During the meeting a Member stressed the importance of properly maintaining highway routes leading to key transport sites, for example, railway stations and park & ride facilities. Having well maintained highways in these areas would provide cyclists looking to access rail travel with confidence which in turn would encourage modal transfer.
- Members agree with the idea of implementing 20 mph zones, however, were concerned that in some areas there appeared to be a lack of enforcement and signage to support the new schemes. They felt that without any clear enforcement initiatives and appropriate signage motorists would simply ignore the lower speed limits. The Committee asked that the Council liaised with key agencies like South Wales Police to ensure that proper measures were put in place for existing and new schemes.
- During the meeting a Member explained that residents in two new housing developments in Pontprennau and Pentrebane had received bus travel subsidies on the day that they moved into their new property. The Committee felt that this was a good idea as it helped promote good travel habits from residents of the new housing developments. They asked the Cabinet Member to look into the practicality of extending this approach to all new housing developments in future.

# PERFORMANCE MONITORING

## Quarterly Performance Monitoring 2016/17

---

During 2016/17 the Committee received quarterly performance monitoring reports for the first three quarters of 2016/17. Quarter 1 focused solely on the performance of services within the City Operations Directorate. Following the creation of Commercial & Collaborative Services during the year, this was expanded to include parts of the Economic Development Directorate in Quarters 2 and 3.

### ➤ **City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17 (6 September 2016)**

On 6 September 2016 Members considered the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report', covering the period 1 April 2016 to 30 June 2016. After the item Members made the following comments relating to the Environment Portfolio and Transport, Planning & Sustainability Portfolio:

#### **Transport, Planning & Sustainability Portfolio**

- The 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17' stated that 17 performance indicators are included in the 'Directorate Delivery Plan'; of these eight were annual and nine were reported on a quarterly basis. From the nine quarterly indicators only four were published in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 1 Performance Report 2016/17' and five were omitted as they were 'awaiting validation'. Members were concerned about this as in effect they were scrutinising the performance of the City Operations Directorate with access to only 23.5% of the identified performance indicators. To support more detailed scrutiny they asked that the five indicators which were 'awaiting validation' were



included in the 'City Operations Directorate – Quarter 2 Performance Report 2016/17' with the appropriate caveat.

- The Committee were pleased to see that PLA/004(a) (the percentage of major planning applications determined during the year within 13 weeks) and PLA/004(c) (the percentage of household planning applications determined during the year within 8 weeks) were green in Quarter 1 after a series of amber and red results during 2015/16.

### **Environment Portfolio**

- During the meeting some Members raised a concerns over the fly tipping incidents in flat communal areas and asked if there were any practical measures that the Council could apply to improve the situation; in particular they were keen to identify ways to improve enforcement.
- A Member commented that the performance indicator results for the removal of fly tipping during Quarter 1 were very impressive and asked for more information on how the fly tipping results were reported and the sources from which they were generated.

### **➤ Performance Reporting – Quarter 2 Performance 2016/17 (15 November 2016)**

On 15 November 2016 Members considered the 'Quarter 2 Performance Report 2016/17'; covering the period 1 July 2016 to 30 September 2016. After the item Members made the following comments relating to the Environment Portfolio and Transport, Planning & Sustainability Portfolio:

#### **Transport, Planning & Sustainability Portfolio**

- At the meeting the Committee reiterated their view that light rail was the best way forward for the South Wales Metro. They felt that the scheme was a more cost effective and flexible transport system. They also stressed

the importance of completing the circle line between Coryton and Radyr as this would significantly improve the transport linkage between the east and west of the city.

### **Environment Portfolio**

- When talking about reuse facilities the Cabinet Member explained that such a scheme would work against the Council in terms of achieving its recycling target. Members were told that when an item is reused instead of being recycled it does not contribute to Cardiff's recycling total - the cabinet Member felt that this was unfair as reuse should probably be at the top of the recycling hierarchy. The Committee agreed with the Cabinet Member's position on this and asked that he lobbied the Welsh Government to provide 'recycling credits' for any reused items.

## **The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report (6 September 2016)**

---

The meeting on 6 September 2016 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report'. The Cabinet Member for the Environment was invited to the meeting and he was supported by officers from the Shared Regulatory Service. Discussion prompted questions and comments which were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member the Environment. The key points made in the letter were:

- The Committee felt that 'The City of Cardiff – Draft 2016 Air Quality Progress Report' was a thorough and well constructed report and passed on their thanks to the officers from the Shared Regulatory Service for the time taken to prepare the document.
- Members were pleased that air quality standards have gradually improved in Cardiff and understand that this appears to be largely down to the gradual improvement of vehicle engines. To support this gradual improvement the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to encourage all bus companies operating in the city to introduce more low polluting hybrid vehicles.

## BRIEFING INFORMATION

### **Members Update: Street Lighting – Member Briefing (14 June 2016)**

---

The meeting on 14 June 2016 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Street Lighting Member Briefing'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Discussion prompted questions and comments which were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability. The key points made in the letter were:

- Members were supportive of the work being undertaken by the Council to procure 13,608 LED lanterns for Cardiff's strategic routes. They felt that the anticipated energy, carbon and financial reductions were a positive thing, however, they were concerned that only the highways lighting stock were within the scope of the tender exercise while the street lighting controlled by housing and parks was excluded. They asked that the Cabinet revisit the proposal to review if it was possible for housing and parks street lighting to be included in the LED scheme; either now or in the near future.
- During the meeting Members asked for confirmation of the anticipated financial savings to be delivered through the LED street lighting scheme.

## **Members Update: Cardiff's Energy Prospectus - Member Update (12 July 2016)**

---

The meeting on 12 July 2016 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's Energy Prospectus – Member Update'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Discussion prompted questions and comments which were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability. The key points made in the letter were:

- They congratulated the officers in the Energy Team for the considerable progress that had been achieved since the last scrutiny of Cardiff's Energy Prospectus in June 2015. In particular they were encouraged that:
  - projects like Radyr Weir have been delivered;
  - progress had been made on the Kelda Anaerobic Digestion Plant;
  - numerous energy efficiency projects had been delivered in schools on the Council's estate and across the wider community;
  - the Council had help drive forward seven exceptionally innovative energy projects;
  - Cardiff now delivers 35MW of local renewable energy (equating to 16% renewable energy provision per head of population - making Cardiff the fourth most successful city in the UK); and that
  - the Energy Team had attracted £6m in external grant funding in the last three years.
  
- Members were concerned about the implications that 'Brexit' might have on a number of projects contained within Cardiff's Energy Prospectus and asked for a summary of the potential impacts from 'Brexit' on projects within Cardiff's Energy Prospectus.
  
- They were supportive of the Groundwater Heat Project currently being developed in Cardiff and felt that using the 28 billion litres of warm water

underneath Cardiff could provide sustainable heating across large parts of the city.

- The Committee found the seven innovation projects being supported by the Council both fascinating and exciting. Innovative ideas like the 'Vivus Lime' quick drying lime render; the 'Q-Bot' underfloor insulation robot; the portable renewables SBRI and the Hydrogen Enabled Local Energy projects came across as both ground breaking and financially lucrative. They asked for details of the longer term benefits of these projects and confirmation as to whether the Council held a financial stake in any of the initiatives.

## **Member Update: Recycling & Waste Restricting Programme – One Year Update (4 October 2016)**

---

Committee scrutinised and commented on an item titled 'Recycling & Waste Restricting Programme – One Year Update' on 4 October 2016. The Cabinet Member for the Environment attended the meeting with officers from Commercial & Collaborative Services. Following discussion, questions and comments, Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for the Environment, making the following key points:

- The Committee asked the Cabinet Member to consider introducing large boards to show the percentage of recycling achieved from materials presented at household waste recycling centres in Cardiff. It was felt this would raise awareness of the need to maximise recycling rates and act as a reminder to staff and the public of the targets that need to be achieved.
- The Committee asked for further information on any new schemes for dealing with waste on property frontages with particular reference as to how the scheme could be accessed and the educational work taking place to support improvements in this area.

## **Member Update: Pavement & Footway Maintenance in Cardiff (4 October 2016)**

---

The meeting on 4 October 2016 gave Committee the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pavement & Footway Maintenance in Cardiff'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting, supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. The letter sent to the Cabinet Member after the meeting made the following key points:

- Members agreed that the best long term approach for pavement and footway maintenance in Cardiff was to take a steady state funding approach. This echoed the comments made about maintenance of the overall highway asset in May 2016.
- Members noted the importance of a well maintained highway asset for Cardiff and in particular emphasised the need for good quality carriageways and pavements. They asked that the Cabinet continued to look for additional capital funds to support further improvements to the overall highway asset.
- The subject of parking across paving slabs and pennant stone was raised during the meeting. Members were concerned about the damage that such irresponsible parking causes and the financial impact that this has on the highway maintenance budget. They asked for a summary of the costs created by this problem.

## **Member Update: Neighbourhood Services (15 November 2016)**

---

The meeting on 15 November 2016 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Neighbourhood Services – Member Update'. The Cabinet Member for the Environment attended the meeting with officers from the City Operations Directorate. Discussion prompted questions and comments that were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member. The key points made in the letter were:

- The Committee continued to advocate the use of body cameras for both evidence gathering and supporting personal safety, particularly for roles that involve enforcement activities.
- The Committee welcomed the implementation of the balanced scorecard approach for performance management within Neighbourhood Services. They looked forward to reviewing the new balanced scorecard and the initial results for Neighbourhood Services in March 2017.



## Member Update: Planning Service (6 December 2016)

---

The meeting on 15 November 2016 provided the Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning Service – member Update'. The Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability was invited to the meeting and was supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate. Discussion prompted questions and comments that were put in a letter to the Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability. The key points made in the letter were:

- Members congratulated Cardiff's Planning Service for their exceptional performance in 2016. In particular, that in 2015/16 they had:
  - processed 3,053 planning applications (a 20% increase);
  - achieved the £1.93 million income generation target;
  - supported the delivery of Cardiff's Local Development Plan;
  - achieved exceptionally low sickness rates;
  - processed an average number of 186 planning applications per planning officer (by far the highest number in Wales);
  - dramatically increased performance against the two main Welsh Government planning indicators; and
  - performed consistently well against the Welsh Government planning applicant feedback indicators.
  
- The Committee thanked the Cardiff's Planning Committee for the large number of planning applications that they considered 2015/16. The number of applications processed was significantly higher than any other Welsh local authority planning committee.
  
- Members noted that the planning fee income target for Cardiff's Planning Service had increased every year for a number of years. They congratulated the Planning Service for achieving these targets, however, were concerned at the regular increases and additional pressures being placed on staff. Members felt that further income target pressures could result in a fall in staff morale, which in turn could increase sickness levels

and ultimately reduce staff productivity. This would affect key targets and the quality of work. In addition to this they questioned the achievability of such targets in the event of an economic slowdown. They concluded by stating that continually increasing planning fee income could become counterproductive and that the policy of continually increasing planning fee income year on year should be reviewed.

- Members noted the comments made by the head of Planning that there were no outstanding actions for the implementation of the Local Development Plan.
- The Committee asked to be consultees for the new Supplementary Planning Guidance for Student Accommodation that was being developed for 2017.
- During the meeting Members noted the importance of a fully adopted Local Development Plan in controlling the development of Cardiff and protecting / supporting the needs of residents. Without such a process the Council would not be able to properly manage where and how development takes place.

## **Member Update: Managing Litter in Cardiff**

### **(15 November 2016)**

---

The meeting on 15 November 2016 gave Committee the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Managing Litter in Cardiff'. The Cabinet Member for the Environment was invited to the meeting, supported by officers from the City Operations Directorate.

Committee's key points following the meeting were:

- The Committee noted the scale of the task facing Cardiff's Street Cleansing Service in keeping the city clean. They thanked all of the staff involved in the task and congratulated them for the improvements delivered in the last 12 months. In particular they felt that the improvement in the scores of the two 'Local Government Data Unit Wales Report – 2015/16' indicators had been a great success.
- Members agreed with the proactive educational messages being delivered in areas like Cathays and welcomed the approach of directing these messages at university students. They also agreed with the idea of issuing house based fixed penalty notices against shared houses.
- The Committee acknowledged the significant improvement achieved in increasing the percentage of reported fly tipping incidents cleared within 5 working days from 82% in 2014/15 to 97.91% in 2015/16. This moved Cardiff from the 21<sup>st</sup> to the 4<sup>th</sup> best performing local authority in Wales.
- It was noted that Neighbourhood Services were in the process of implementing a new AMX infrastructure asset management tool and that a 'reporter app' was being developed to make it easier for the public to report things like potholes and fly tipping incidents. The Committee welcomed this approach and looked forward to a progress update.

## **Member Update: Commercial & Collaboration Services – Progress Update (10 January 2017)**

---

The meeting on 10 January 2017 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee and Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Commercial & Collaboration Services – Progress Update'. The Cabinet Members for the Environment and Corporate Services & Performance were invited to the meeting and were supported by officers from Commercial & Collaborative Services. The key points put into a letter to the Cabinet Members were:

### **Fleet Services**

- Members welcomed the implementation of the Civic Tranman fleet management software believing that this would be a vast improvement to the card and spreadsheet systems previously used. It would create significantly better financial control across the service.
- The Committee were very pleased at the progress that had been made in terms of balancing the budget. At the time of the meeting the service had been anticipating a budget overspend of £24,000 for 2016/17, however, this was a significant improvement when compared to the £1.76 million overspend which was achieved in 2013/14.
- Members were pleased to see that the vehicle utilisation programme had already started to deliver savings against a two-year savings target of £400,000.
- The Committee welcomed the introduction of zero-based budgeting and cost pricing model into Fleet Services. This was something that was advocated during recent scrutiny of the Infrastructure Services project.

- It was pleasing to see that the service had a better understanding in terms of the actual capacity and capability of the service. For example, understanding how much of the workshop was actually used had created new income generation and partnership opportunities.

### **Total Facilities Management**

- Members welcome the approval to start the installation of the RAMIS system in early 2017. They felt that this much needed property maintenance system would provide an essential single point to consolidate property data from across the whole Council estate.
- They welcomed the increased focus on income generation; in particular they were pleased that the service was focusing its attention on gaining back lost business from schools.
- The Committee welcomed the projected budget surplus of £102,000 for the financial year 2016/17. This was viewed as a positive achievement given the recent changes to the service.

### **Recycling & Waste Services**

- Members noted that the sickness levels within Recycling & Waste Services were high. They accepted that some improvement had taken place and hoped to see further improvements to service sickness levels.
- The Committee were pleased that the service was progressing with further ICT procurement of in cab and mobile working solutions. They hoped that the new systems would improve efficiency and help avoid “failure demand”.
- They were pleased that the Commercial Waste Service had continuously increased its income levels during 2016/17, for example, they had recently

won a Millennium Stadium contract for dealing with Commercial Waste from BIFFA.

- During the meeting the Committee were reminded of some of the proposals and opportunities which could possibly arise as a result the new Welsh Environment Act. The Committee again reiterated the importance of Recycling & Waste Services being prepared for the changes and opportunities created by this new Act.
- The Committee was encouraged that Recycling & Waste Services anticipated delivering a balanced budget in 2016/17 and that it was on target to meet all statutory recycling targets for the same year.

### **Commercial & Collaborative Services - General Comments**

- Members welcomed the creation of new apprenticeships within the service.
- Members acknowledged that sickness rates had improved since the creation of Commercial & Collaborative Services, however, still believed that there was significant room for further improvement.
- The Committee was encouraged by the willingness of Commercial & Collaborative Services to adopt established third party systems for each of the parts of the new service. They saw this as a huge step forward in terms of improving efficiency and becoming more commercially aware.
- The Committee was pleased that agency costs had reduced by 13% since the creation of the Commercial & Collaboration Service, however, the overall agency costs were still high.
- Members felt that improvements had been made in the area of staff training opportunities, particularly in Recycling & Waste Services. They

felt that this was a positive step that would support both staff development, morale and the Council's ability to deliver the best standards of service.

- The Committee congratulated Commercial & Collaborative Services for the amount of progress that they had made in a relatively short time. Members felt that it was pleasing to see that the service had agreed with and followed through on a number of key recommendations from recent scrutiny of the Infrastructure Services Project, for example, delivering swift improvement, implementing specialist 3<sup>rd</sup> party service delivery software, introducing new training opportunities, focusing on income generation and improving financial control through zero based budgeting.

## CALL IN

### **Cardiff West Transport Interchange – Consideration of Called – In Cabinet Decision CAB/16/38 (8 February 2017)**

---

At a meeting on 8 February 2017 Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee had the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff West Transport Interchange – Consideration of Called – In Cabinet Decision CAB/16/38'. The Cabinet Decision CAB/16/38 was called in following the Cabinet meeting on 15 December 2016, which resolved:

- The proposed Western Transport Interchange development be approved;
- Authority be delegated to the Director of City Operations in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Finance, Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability, the Council's 151 Officer and the Director of Law and Governance to deal with all aspects of the procurement of the Works for the Western Interchange Development as set out in this report, up to and including the award of the contract;
- The transfer of Indicative Capital Programme allocation from Bus Corridor improvements to the Cardiff West Interchange Scheme be approved.

After the call in Members considered the evidence and voted to refer the matter back to Cabinet for further consideration. In referring the decision back to Cabinet the Committee referenced a series of issues of concern including finance, parking, traffic congestion, potential site development options, cycling and transport connectivity.



## SCRUTINY REVIEW – BETTER DECISIONS

Wales Audit Office (WAO)'s February 2016 inspection report included the following recommendations, which impacted on Scrutiny in Cardiff:

- Develop an approach to cross-cutting scrutiny (given the increasing nature of collaborative service delivery and governance, and the Wellbeing of Future Generations agenda).
- Consider scrutiny's role in addressing the strategic challenges facing the Council at this point in time.
- Ensure that any vacancies on scrutiny committees are filled quickly.
- Consider webcasting scrutiny committees.

To address the first two of these recommendations, the Council has been undertaking a Review of Scrutiny, with recommendations to be implemented from the start of the next political term. The Review engaged Members, officers and external stakeholders, and the resultant report was reported to Constitution Committee on 2 March 2017.

This Committee has taken a key role in delivering cross-cutting and partnership scrutiny work which is detailed elsewhere in this report. In brief, however, they have included:

- Joint meetings with Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee to jointly scrutinise proposals for an Alternative Delivery Mechanisms for Business Infrastructure Services.
- Joint task and finish groups, for example to consider the Community Infrastructure Levy.
- In September 2015 it was agreed that the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee would take lead overview role for scrutinising the work of Cardiff Partnership Board, with this Committees

undertaking detailed scrutiny of Partnership Board work streams relevant to its terms of reference.

- Committee has during the year led a pioneering task and finish inquiry on river pollution, developing partnership with Welsh Water, Natural Resources Wales, Glamorgan Anglers, Keep Wales Tidy, neighbouring local authorities, Groundwork Wales, Cardiff Rivers Group and South Wales Rivers Trust.

Committee vacancies are allocated to political groups under political proportionality rules, are discussed on a monthly basis with Party Group Whips, and have been offered to other political groups and independent councillors. Appointments to vacancies on committees have been considered as a standing item on all council meeting agendas. As a short-term measure, Full Council in July 2016 decided to reduce the number of members on scrutiny committees down to eight Members for the remainder of this Administration. The 2016 Member Survey also explored the challenges that Members faced in filling vacant Committee places. It found a range of challenges, including other Council duties, family and work pressures to be key factors, which it is hoped will inform arrangements for the new Council following the 2017 Council elections.

Webcasting facilities are in place in County Hall and in the City Hall Chamber, allowing some Scrutiny committee meetings and Full Council meetings to be webcast. The Management Statement of Action directed the introduction of webcasting of committee meetings to include one scrutiny committee meeting per month from December 2016. Committees piloted webcasting between November and December, and Economy & Culture scrutiny committee held the first live scrutiny webcast in December 2016.

## RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and can also suggest any new issues which may be of interest to the Committee. The following issues are considered as suitable for inclusion in the 2017/18 work programme:

- Neighbourhood Services – Member Update
- Commercial & Collaborative Services – Member Update
- Cardiff's Transport Strategy
- Cardiff Bay & City Centre Master Plans
- Household Waste Recycling Centre – Member Update
- Managing Litter in Cardiff
- Cardiff's Waste Management Strategy – Member Update
- Waste Enforcement Services – Member Update
- Planning Service – Member Update
- Highway Asset Management – Member Update
- Cardiff's Parking Strategy – Member Update
- Cardiff Tidal Lagoon

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,  
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW  
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)

© 2017 City and County of Cardiff