

My Ref: S&LL/SOP/RP

Your Ref:

23 December 2009

Ms C Davies
Schools Management and Effectiveness Division
Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills
Welsh Assembly Government
Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NQ

Dear Ms Davies

**SCHOOL STANDARDS & FRAMEWORK ACT 1998
PROPOSALS –**

- **TO DISCONTINUE LLANEDEYRN HIGH SCHOOL**
- **TO ESTABLISH A NEW WELSH-MEDIUM SECONDARY SCHOOL ON THE CURRENT ST TEILO'S CHURCH IN WALES HIGH SCHOOL SITE**
- **TO TRANSFER ST TEILO'S CHURCH IN WALES HIGH SCHOOL TO THE SITE OF LLANEDEYRN HIGH SCHOOL**
- **INCREASE THE CAPACITY OF THE SCHOOL FROM 1114 PLACES TO 1440 PLACES**
- **ESTABLISH PROVISION FOR CHILDREN WITH SPECIAL EDUCATIONAL NEEDS (VISUAL IMPAIRMENT)**

**PUBLISHED 24 SEPTEMBER 2009
END OF OBJECTION PERIOD 24 NOVEMBER 2009
SUMMARY OF OBJECTIONS AND COMMENTS**

Over the last decade, there has been a steady and significant decline in the number of pupils seeking admission to Llanedeyrn High School. Given the significant over supply of school places in this area of Cardiff, this proposal was brought forward in order to address the balance of supply of and demand for school places and to provide environments for learning and community development that will be more fit for purpose.

This proposal seeks to:

- Remove surplus English-medium capacity
- Respond to demand for Welsh-medium provision across Cardiff in appropriate localities.
- Provide significant investment in school buildings
- Address revenue budget challenges facing Llanedeyrn High School
- Ensure access to viable, successful schools

Further to the above proposals, I enclose herewith the objections received for the proposals mentioned above, and include below the Council's comments incorporating comments from the Governing Body at St Teilo's Church in Wales (CiW) High School. The headings in bold below are issues that have been raised by one or more objectors to the proposals outlined above.

1. In response to the Llanedeyrn High School statutory notice issued on 24th September 2009 and running until 24th November 2009 the Council has received a total of 351 individual pieces of correspondence. Of these 332 have been logged as formal objections to the proposals contained within the notices. 18 pieces of correspondence received did not include the senders' names and addresses and so have not been considered. Should WAG require sight of the latter they have been retained and will be made available upon request. 1 response was received in support of the proposal.

A total number of 350 objections (i.e. individual pieces of correspondence) were submitted by a total of 346 objectors (individual respondents) received from 294 addresses.

The table below indicates where objections were received from:

Respondent address	Objection to Notice 1 Llanedeyrn High School Closure only	Objection to Notice 2 relocation of St Teilo's CIW School onto the Llanedeyrn High School Site
Areas directly affected by the proposal (Llanedeyrn, Penylan, Pentwyn and Pontprennau)	250	1
Other areas of Cardiff	55	1
Outside of Cardiff	23	
No correspondence address	18	
Total	346	2

The remaining 4 objections to the proposal to close Llanedeyrn High School were made by individual persons who had already submitted objections to the proposal i.e. these 4 objections consist of duplications of letters or issues from the same respondent.

Most of the specific points of objection lodged and therefore addressed in this report were covered by an extensive letter of objection from the Governing Body of Llanedeyrn High School, which was sent as an objection to both the Council at St Teilo's CiW High School Governing Body statutory notices. Objections were also received in the form of a proforma letter from 275 individual respondents relating to the proposed closure of Llanedeyrn High School. The proforma letter did not raise any new issues in addition to those in the main stakeholder response.

Additionally the Council received a total of 71 individual letters and emails which raised a number of arguments against the proposals contained within the statutory notices.

A further 110 responses were received from Llanedeyrn High School pupils. The majority of these concerns are consistent with the various responses above.

Finally, 2 objections (including that from Llanedeyrn High School Governing Body) were received in respect of the proposal to relocate St Teilo's CiW High School on the existing Llanedeyrn High School site.

The verbatim extracts in bold within the report are summaries of objections and concerns raised. The paragraphs following these points contain the Council's comments, incorporating comments from the Governing Body at St Teilo's CiW High School, in response to the main objections and concerns raised.

- 2. The Governors, staff, pupils and parents all believe that Llanedeyrn High School is a successful and improving school with very many strengths. Its prospects for sustained improvement, we believe, are very good with a clear vision for the successful provision of high quality education for local children in their local school.**

Llanedeyrn High School is a successful and rapidly improving school with many outstanding features.

The required level of LEA support 'school category' has improved again. Developments in monitoring, evaluation and review, INSET/ School Improvement Planning Priorities, teaching and learning and leadership and management now strongly underpin a culture of sustainable improvement. The Governors, staff, pupils and parents all agree that the prospects for year on year improvement are good.

Whilst the Council acknowledges that progress has been made at Llanedeyrn High School this does not alter the fact that over the last decade, there has been a steady and significant decline in the number of pupils seeking admission to Llanedeyrn High School. Given the significant over supply of school places in the East of Cardiff, this proposal is made in conjunction with other proposals in order to address the balance of and demand for school places, and to provide improvements for learning and community development that will be more fit for purpose.

Under this proposal the children from the Llanedeyrn High School catchment will attend one of three secondary schools, Cardiff High School, Llanishen High School or St Teilo's CiW High School, all of which are popular, successful and high achieving schools.

As can be seen from extracts below from the most recent ESTYN inspection reports and benchmarking information for these three schools, the standard of education

provided by all of these schools is good and all provide supportive caring environments (copies of the inspection reports are attached).

THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION AT CARDIFF HIGH SCHOOL

Cardiff High School received its last inspection report in January 2007. The school was described as a very good school with many outstanding features. The highest grade was awarded for each of the key questions. Standards and the quality of teaching and assessment and leadership at all levels, were praised in the report. This view of the school concurs with that of the Local Authority. The school has continued to perform very well and continues to receive very strong support from parents and the community.

Benchmark information locates the school in the top 25% of similar schools nationally. The outcomes of teacher assessment at KS3 have continued to show improvement from already high levels. This is also the case at KS4 and post sixteen.

KS3

	2009	2008	2007
Benchmark group	Up to 10% FSM (5.1)	Up to 10% FSM (5.2)	Up to 10 FSM (5.1)
English	1	1	1
Mathematics	1	1	1
Science	1	1	1
CS1	1	1	1

KS4

	2009	2008	2007
Benchmark group	Up to 10% (5.1)	Up to 10% (5.2)	Up to 10% (5.1)
Achieved 5A* - C	N/A	1	1
Achieved 5A* - G	N/A	N/A	2
Level 1 threshold	1	1	3
Level 2 threshold	1	1	1
Level 2 threshold including EN/We and Ma	1	1	N/A
CSI	1	1	1
Average points score	N/A	N/A	1
Average wider points score	1	1	2
Achieved C+ in English	N/A	N/A	1
Achieved C+ in Maths	N/A	N/A	1
Achieved C+ in Science	N/A	N/A	1
Achieved level 2 in English	1	1	1
Achieved level 2 in maths	1	1	1
Achieved level 2 in science	1	1	1

KS3 T.A. Trends % Level 5+

Subject	2009	2008	2007
English	93.9%	92.5%	93.2%
Maths	92.1%	91.5%	89.3%
Science	93.9%	94.8%	91.3%
CSI	88.3%	87.7%	85.0%

KS4 Trends over time

Performance Indicator	2009	2008	2007
Achieved 5A* - C	87%	85%	80%
<i>Achieved the Level 2 threshold</i>	89%	85%	N/A
<i>Achieved the Level 2 threshold including a GCSE pass in English or Welsh first language and mathematics</i>	83%	76%	N/A
Achieved 5A* - G	100%	100%	93%
<i>Achieved the Level 1 threshold</i>	100%	100%	N/A
CSI	81%	75%	72%
Average points score	N/A	N/A	54
<i>Average wider points score</i>	496	463	423
<i>Leaving without a recognised qualification</i>	0%	0%	0%
Achieved C+ in English	91%	90%	88%
Achieved C+ in Maths	88%	80%	76%
Achieved C+ in Science	92%	86%	80%
Achieved C+ in Welsh	74%	65%	61%

THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION AT LLANISHEN HIGH SCHOOL

The school was last inspected in March 2009. The report recognised features that are good or very good. These include results in test and examinations, the range of extra-curricular activities, the support and guidance for learners and the provision for pupils with special educational needs. The inspection team judged that the school is in need of some improvement, with some of the main aspects highlighted including aspects of standards, learning teaching and behaviour, especially at KS3 and the robustness and effectiveness of monitoring and evaluation procedures.

The authority is currently working with the school to implement an action plan to address the recommendations in the inspection report. The authority shares the determination of the school's governing body and the senior leadership team to make the required improvements.

While the outcome of the inspection is disappointing, full weight has also to be given to the school's academic performance. The results recorded in 2008 at GCSE were the best the school has achieved to date. Nearly 70% of pupils achieved the equivalent of 5 GCSE grades A*-C and 94% achieved 5 grades A*-G. Results in the sixth form were also the best the school has ever recorded with 50 students achieving at least three A grades at AS or A2 level. In 2008, not a single pupil left the school without any qualification and the school's attendance rate of nearly 93% was the third best of any secondary school in Cardiff. The school's position relative to that of similar schools is expected to improve again this year.

Early indications from the 2009 data suggest that the school has built further on last year's good performance.

KS3

	2008	2007	2006
Benchmark group	Up to 10% FSM (7.5)	Up to 10% FSM (8.9)	Up to 10% FSM (7.2)
English	2	3	4
Mathematics	1	3	3
Science	2	3	3
CSI	1	4	4

KS4

	2008	2007	2006
Benchmark group	Up to 10% FSM (7.5)	Up to 10% FSM (8.9)	Up to 10% FSM (7.2)
Achieved 5A* - C	3	3	3
Achieved 5A* - G		1	2
Level 1 threshold	2		
Level 2 threshold	3		
Level 2 threshold including EN/We and Ma	3		
CSI	3	4	3
Average points score		2	3
Average wider points score	2		
Achieved C+ in English		2	2
Achieved C+ in Maths		2	3
Achieved C+ in Science		3	4

Table 1 KS3 T.A. Trends % Level 5+

Subject	2008	2007	2006
English	80.9%	74.5%	69.2%
Maths	85.7%	77.9%	76.6%
Science	84.9%	77.6%	77.3%
CSI	76.1%	63.5%	61.2%

Table 1 KS4 Trends over time

Performance Indicator	2008	2007	2006
Achieved 5A* - C	66%	63%	64%
Achieved the Level 2 threshold	69%	N/A	N/A
Achieved the Level 2 threshold including a GCSE pass in English or Welsh first language and mathematics	57%	N/A	N/A
Achieved 5A* - G	94%	97%	93%
Achieved the Level 1 threshold	96%	N/A	N/A
CSI	56%	44%	50
Average points score		53	48
Average wider points score	411	405	380
Leaving without a recognised qualification	0%	0%	2%
Achieved C+ in English	71%	76%	76%
Achieved C+ in Maths	64%	64%	62%
Achieved C+ in Science	67%	48%	52%
Achieved C+ in Welsh	67%	59%	60%

THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION AT ST TEILO'S CiW HIGH SCHOOL

St. Teilo's CiW High School was last inspected in January 2008. Inspectors described the school as a good school with a distinctive Christian ethos. For the seven key questions the school received two grades at grade 1 and five at grade 2. The quality of teaching was judged to be good overall. Other strengths highlighted included the quality of leadership, pupils' behaviour and support for their well-being. The school enjoys good relationships with parents and is committed to a strong profile in the community. This overall picture of the school is supported by the Council.

Benchmark information places the school in either the top 25% or top 50% when performance is compared with that of similar schools at KS3, although there is greater variation at KS4.

Around four-fifths of pupils have achieved the expected level in each of the core subjects and the CSI and this has been consistent over the last three years. There has been steady improvement at KS4.

KS3

	2009	2008	2007
Benchmark group	Over 10% to 15% FSM (10.9)	Over 10% to 15% FSM (11.1)	Over 10% to 15% FSM (10.8)
English	1	1	1
Mathematics	2	2	1
Science	1	2	2
CS1	1	1	1

KS4

	2009	2008	2007
Benchmark group	Over 10% to 15% FSM (10.9)	Over 10% to 15% FSM (11.1)	Over 10% to 15% FSM (10.8)
Achieved 5A* - C	N/A	2	3
Achieved 5A* - G	N/A	N/A	1
Level 1 threshold	3	2	1
Level 2 threshold	2	2	2
Level 2 threshold including EN/We and Ma	2	3	N/A
CSI	3	3	3
Average points score	N/A	N/A	2
Average wider points score	4	3	2
Achieved C+ in English	N/A	N/A	2
Achieved C+ in Maths	N/A	N/A	3
Achieved C+ in Science	N/A	N/A	3
Achieved level 2 in English	2	3	2
Achieved level 2 in English	2	2	3
Achieved level 2 in English	3	3	3

KS3 T.A. Trends % Level 5+

Subject	2009	2008	2007
English	79.3%	81.7%	79.6%
Maths	79.8%	79.1%	80.1%
Science	85.5%	82.2%	80.1%
CSI	71.0%	70.7%	68.1%

KS4 Trends over time

Performance Indicator	2009	2008	2007
Achieved 5A* - C	65%	64%	60%
<i>Achieved the Level 2 threshold</i>	67%	65%	N/A
<i>Achieved the Level 2 threshold including a GCSE pass in English or Welsh first language and mathematics</i>	53%	46%	N/A
Achieved 5A* - G	91%	94%	94%
Performance Indicator	2009	2008	2007
<i>Achieved the Level 1 threshold</i>	91%	94%	N/A
CSI	50%	44%	38%
Average points score	N/A	N/A	45
<i>Average wider points score</i>	347	353	359
<i>Leaving without a recognised qualification</i>	1.0%	0%	2.0%
Achieved C+ in English	70%	64%	66%
Achieved C+ in Maths	60%	56%	51%
Achieved C+ in Science	62%	63%	47%
Achieved C+ in Welsh	51%	48%	45%

Each one of the three schools will be able to offer equal opportunities for access to a high quality of education and provide varied opportunities, which will support the achievement of high standards by all learners (copies of the ESTYN inspection reports are at Appendix 1).

3. Viability and Sustainability- The school roll whilst diminishing, WOULD be stable at around 650-700 if the threat of closure was removed; making it a viable, sustainable school, with good prospects for increased roll/numbers.

The aim of this proposal is to maintain viable, successful English-medium (EM) secondary provision and to establish of a third Welsh-medium high school in order to meet demand.

Currently, Llanedeyrn High School is operating with a deficit budget of £604,000. It has the highest number of surplus places, the lowest number of catchment children attending the school (31.8% of its catchment population in January 2009), and the greatest outflow of children to Voluntary Aided (VA) and other community high schools of the three community high schools.

The past decade (i.e. prior to the proposed closure in the City Wide Investment Plan of 2006) has seen a steady decline in the number of pupils attending Llanedeyrn High School, with 642 pupils on roll at January 2009.

At present there are 3595 English-medium community places and 150 English-medium parish places available across the four schools, while forecasts show that 3100 will be sufficient to meet local English-medium catchment non-denominational demand and to allow for up to 10% surplus.

Projections for the school indicate that the rate of decline will continue with the number on roll reducing to 560 at September 2013, which equates to less than four forms of entry. As set out in the Audit Commission Trading Places The Supply and Allocation of School Places (1996) report, small schools represent poor value for money because of their high unit costs and are less likely to be designated by inspectors as 'meeting with success'.

4. The curriculum continues to provide a broad, balanced entitlement for all pupils and meets all statutory regulations at both KS3 and KS4. Indeed the innovative approach to the skills agenda at KS3 and the close working partnerships at KS4 with the 14-19 partners, demonstrate an enriched and forward thinking curriculum, highly adapted to suit the needs of our particular pupils. Would this be the same elsewhere?

The current curriculum at Llanedeyrn High School provides a broad, balanced entitlement for all pupils and does meet the statutory needs at both KS3 and KS4. The school has in recent times worked more closely with its partner schools and the local college to broaden the range of courses on offer at KS4. This has broadened a KS4 curriculum that was dominated by GCSE options. The curriculum has been enriched and will develop further but is not, in the context of similar schools in Cardiff, particularly highly adapted to the needs of pupils from the local catchment. The Council is confident that at least the same level of provision would be provided at the three schools listed within these proposals.

Llanedeyrn High School is operating with a deficit budget of £604,000 and a decreasing number of pupils on roll resulting in a further drop in the level of funding available to the school which is likely to impact on the quality of education the school will be able to provide going forward in contrast to the quality of education available at the alternative schools children would attend under this proposal.

The school's deficit budget also represents an inefficient and ineffective distribution of resources as it effectively reduces funds that would otherwise be available for more viable, successful schools.

5. Community Focused Schools Issues- Local Schools for Local Children

- **92.8% of LHS cohort is from the local community, the highest percentage in Cardiff**

- **Some of the highest levels of deprivation/social disadvantage in Cardiff. Research data clearly indicates that pupils from these backgrounds suffer the most in terms of educational achievement if they are made to travel out of their communities to be educated. We are expecting the most vulnerable to deal with major upheaval and uncertainty, the consequences of which will lead to educational underachievement if not NEETS for this group of pupils.**
- **A strong, well represented Community Management Group, that provides clear vision and direction for community focused activity.**
- **Increasing use of school facilities to provide community focussed learning.**
- **Family Group Support Services.**
- **Crèche facilities.**

The proportion of parents opting to educate their children at Llanedeyrn High School has fallen in recent years.

As outlined previously, in January 2009 only 31.8% of the Llanedeyrn catchment area pupil population opted to attend the school, the lowest percentage in Cardiff.

Pupils attending local (catchment) school – past 3 years						
	January 2007 (PLASC)		January 2008 (PLASC)		January 2009 (PLASC)	
School	Pupils resident in catchment	Pupils attending catchment school	Pupils resident in catchment	Pupils attending catchment school	Pupils resident in catchment	Pupils attending catchment school
Cardiff High School	1002	852 (85.2%)	997	842 (84.5%)	1018	850 (83.5%)
Llanedeyrn High School	2012	724 (36.0%)	2000	680 (34%)	2020	642 (31.8%)
Llanishen High School	1600	1149 (71.8%)	1616	1126 (69.7%)	1572	1091 (69.4%)
Totals	4614	2725	4613	2648	4610	2583

NB: A proportion of the 4610 pupils are taking up places at denominational or Welsh-medium schools.

The Llanedeyrn High School catchment area is comprised of the combined catchment areas of:

Bryn Celyn Primary School,
 Glyncoed Infant & Junior Schools,
 Llanedeyrn Primary School,
 Marlborough Infant & Junior Schools, and
 Springwood Primary School.

The table overleaf outlines the number of pupils attending Llanedeyrn High School in January 2009, and the number of pupils resident in each of the above primary school catchment areas who attended the school.

Pupils attending Llanedeyrn High School (January 2009) resident in the combined primary areas								
Year	Bryn Celyn Primary School	Glyncoed Infant & Junior School	Llanedeyrn Primary School	Marlborough Junior & Infant School	Springwood Primary School	Sub-total	Other schools	Total
7	41	12	34	2	21	110	2	112
8	42	12	30	2	36	122	12	134
9	41	24	33	1	28	127	10	137
10	40	20	38	5	40	143	15	158
11	50	18	39	2	31	140	16	156
Total	214	86	174	12	156	642	55	697
Pupil population (Yr 7-11)	702	230	419	376	293	2020		
% of pupil population attending Llanedeyrn HS	30.5%	37.4%	41.5%	3.2%	53.2%	31.8%		

Of the pupils residing in the 2 catchment areas that are the greatest distance from Llanishen High School (Bryn Celyn Primary School and Marlborough Junior School), only 21% of these choose to attend Llanedeyrn High School.

In terms of “*expecting the most vulnerable to deal with major upheaval and uncertainty*” only one year group will be moved as a result of these proposals, all other pupils will have the opportunity to see out their education at Llanedeyrn High School. With regard to the single year group who would be required to move at the end of Key Stage 3, or Year 10 if their parents so wish, every effort will be made to ensure a successful transfer.

Under these proposals the development of improved life chances for these young people would be supported through the opportunity to attend one of three good quality high schools with high attendance levels, good pastoral care and exam results.

Historically, the primary schools in Llanedeyrn have always been the main facilitators for community focused activities, particularly those involving parents and children working together. Programmes such as Families Learning Together, Emerging Writing, Teaching Assistant courses, Family Breakfast Clubs, and Cardiff Cooks have been held in the primary schools along with a huge range of out of school hours activities catering for the pupils.

In addition to this the Powerhouse Community Centre is centrally placed and provides one of the most modern and suitable premises for community facilities especially Adult and Community Learning. The Powerhouse is well organised and provides a comprehensive range of provision for young people and adults including the Youth Service. It has also provided a well established link to the local primary schools.

It is considered that until recently, Llanedeyrn High School has had limited engagement with the community although it does allow for provision of football

clubs to practice and while efforts were made by the Council to find someone within the school who would be proactive and lead on developing Community Focused Provision, this too has only happened recently.

6. The Consultation

Details in the closure do not reflect the original consultation document

Officers believe that this comment relates to the proposal that the 2010/2011 intake would not complete their secondary education at Llanedeyrn High School.

The public consultation regarding the proposal ran from 5 November to 21 December 2007 and took place alongside consultations relating to Llanrumney/Rumney High Schools, St Anne's Church in Wales Infant School and Cefn Onn Primary School.

The Council Executive on 14 July 2008 received a report on the outcome of the four consultations and it was recommended that officers continue to work with "St Teilo's to address the finer issues around open places and new build, and at the same time progress proposals to address surplus places, the location of a new Welsh-medium high school and the school transport and congestion issues and agreed that officers report back to the Executive in the Autumn".

Subsequently a report to Executive on 04 December 2008 sought permission to publish a statutory notice to discontinue Llanedeyrn High School on a phased basis from September 2010, to be completed by August 2014. This report advised that this would require Llanedeyrn High School to admit no pupils into Year 7 from September 2010 in order to facilitate the opportunity for the transfer of a year group from St Teilo's to the Llanedeyrn site in 2011. Year 7 Pupils admitted to Llanedeyrn in 2009 would be able to complete their schooling at Llanedeyrn High School. Llanedeyrn High School would then officially close in August 2014. This is a year later than reported to the Executive on 22 October 2007 and subsequently consulted on. This delay arose out of the time taken to complete the further work agreed at the Executive meeting in July 2008.

The admissions arrangements for the academic year 2010/11 were consulted on in early 2009 and in accordance with Welsh Assembly Government code of practice had to be published by 15 April 2009. As the statutory process would not have allowed for the publication of a statutory notice and determination of this proposal in sufficient time to meet with this timetable it was then necessary to allow admittance into Year 7 at Llanedeyrn High School in 2010.

Conscious of the significant budget difficulties and consequential threat to standards of education faced by Llanedeyrn High School it was felt that the original timetable for the closure of the school should be retained and as a result of this it would be necessary for the 2010 Year 7 intake to transfer at the end of Key Stage 3 (Year 9) or at the end of Year 10 if their parents so wished.

The consultation which took place was on the basis that children admitted to Llanedeyrn High School in 2008 would continue at the school until they had completed their studies in Year 11 which is consistent with the details outlined in the statutory notice published on 24 September 2009 which stated that pupils admitted to Llanedeyrn High School up to and including the academic year 2009/10 would be able to complete their schooling at Llanedeyrn High School. No such undertaking was given to pupils who are now to be admitted in 2010/11 as during consultation it was not envisaged that this would be an option.

The admissions policy/booklet Admissions to School 2010/11 along with letters sent to parents made clear the situation regarding pupils to be admitted during 2010/11. This is also clear in the Statutory Notice(s) published prior to the date of return of parental preference forms. Thus parents are able to make a clear and informed decision as to whether they wish to avail themselves of this unexpected opportunity.

Key elements of the consultation took place on the basis of agreements that had not been reached.

At the time when the consultation took place, the Governors of St Teilo's and the Council were in the process of negotiating admission arrangements for the proposed enlarged school. As a result of this, the agreed new admissions arrangements make provision in the over-subscription criteria for an increase in places for children with no particular faith background (Parish places) from 16.6% to 33% of the annual intake. The criteria also place proximity of the family home to the school as a key determinant in three of the four over-subscription criteria, thus making greater provision for those resident within the local community.

Learners voice not listened to or sought

As part of any school organisation consultation Council officers will if requested meet with School Councils. Llanedeyrn High School was contacted several times however the offer of a meeting was not responded to. During the same period, Llanrumney High School and Rumney High School both took up the offer of such meetings with their school councils.

The consultation documents were largely inaccessible to the community

As part of any consultation on school organisation proposals the Council publishes a consultation document which sets out the proposal, the implications of the proposal and the background information. The consultation document and overall process follows the same format used by the Council for other school organisation proposals, a number of which have now received Ministerial approval. We believe that the consultation document was as clear and concise as possible given the information that needed to be imparted. The Council's Legal Department advised that the document was appropriate.

As part of this consultation opportunities were made available for members of the community to attend two drop in sessions at Pentwyn Leisure Centre 12 & 23 November 2007. In addition there were public meetings on 12 & 20 November 2007 at Llanedeyrn High School, and a meeting on 27 November 2007 at St Teilo's CiW

High School where presentations of the main aspects of the proposals were made and where people could ask questions, seek clarification and make comments.

7. Inconsistent arguments used in the Schools Organisation Plan –

Key aims of the SOP are to remove overcapacity and to provide local schools for local children. The LHS catchment is densely populated and birth rates are increasing. It is currently only 2nd to Whitchurch High School in the number of pupils in its catchment. Additionally, within alternate site proposals for the LDP plan, under review by WAG, there are applications for the designation of greenfield sites for family housing within the LHS and Llanishen catchment areas. Governors therefore believe that the SOP has not adequately considered the location of its community schools in light of the projected density of pupil location.

If LHS is closed and its catchment allocated as per the closure notice then any further increase in population would need to be absorbed by Llanishen High School because Cardiff High School will have no ability to further expand (the reason given for the majority of LHS catchment being allocated to Llanishen). Llanishen High is set to expand to 11 forms of entry. Growth in the population would increase this and the school would become the largest school in the Whitchurch area - larger than Whitchurch High School which is proposed to be reduced!

The Council's document entitled 'School Organisation Proposals: A Strategic Framework For A School Buildings Improvement Programme' (Appendix 2) does not set any target size for the catchment area or travelling distance in relation to a 'local school'. The use of the term 'Local Schools for Local Children' means that a place at a local school should be available for every child living within the catchment area who would require one. The phrase is one of the of the principles in the Strategic Framework, with the purpose that *'proposals will be designed to create the situation that parents will turn with confidence to a local school secure in the knowledge that it will offer a high quality of education'*.

There are currently 445 surplus places between the four high schools which serve this area of the city, with Llanedeyrn High School having the greatest number of surplus places and the lowest number of children from its catchment attending the school, and projections for the school showing a further decline in pupil numbers.

At present only 31.8% of the pupils resident in its catchment area attend the school.

The following table details the secondary schools attended by pupils resident within the primary school catchment areas which make up the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area (pupils aged 11-16; PLASC 2009).

Pupils resident in Llanedeyrn High School catchment area: January 2009						
Secondary schools attended	Bryn Celyn Primary School	Glyncoed Infant & Junior School	Llanedeyrn Primary School	Marlborough Junior & Infant School	Springwood Primary School	Total
Llanedeyrn High School	214	86	174	12	156	642
Cardiff High School	29	18	16	33	7	103
Llanishen High School	52	12	8	12	5	89
St Teilo's C.W. High School	114	33	93	105	69	414
Corpus Christi Catholic High School	195	53	71	76	36	431
Welsh-medium Schools	34	10	13	60	3	120
Other English-medium or Faith schools	64	18	44	78	17	221
Total	702	230	419	376	293	2020

Appeals for admission to both Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School were considered from within the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area in each of the past 2 years. Thus if the capacity at Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School were increased it is likely that an even larger number of pupils from the current Llanedeyrn High School catchment area would be admitted to these schools, regardless of any proposal to close Llanedeyrn High School. It is evident that a high level demand for places at both Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School currently exists from within the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area.

Under this proposal Llanishen High School would expand to 10 forms of entry and not 11, as stated in the Llanedeyrn High School Governing Body objection, which projections show to be sufficient to meet the new catchment demand.

It is proposed that Cardiff High School expands to 8 forms of entry (1200 pupil places, age 11-16), and Llanishen High School to 10 forms of entry (1500 places). An additional 50 parish places will be created at St Teilo's CW High School bringing the total to 80 i.e. 400 at 11-16 and the school will operate at 8 forms of entry.

Trend based projections supplied by Cardiff Council to the Welsh Assembly Government in 2009 for Cardiff High School, Llanedeyrn High School and Llanishen High School are overleaf.

2009 Trend-based projections (age 11-16)						
	Jan 2009	Jan 2010	Jan 2011	Jan 2012	Jan 2013	Jan 2014
Cardiff High	1056	1051	1027	1012	1009	986
Llanedeyrn High	697	640	591	568	556	559
Llanishen High	1336	1335	1306	1263	1230	1174
Total	3089	3026	2924	2843	2794	2718

Projections in respect of the number of pupils requiring education within an English-medium school are below.

2009 Catchment projections (age 11-16, community schools only)						
	Jan 2009 (actual)	Jan 2010	Jan 2011	Jan 2012	Jan 2013	Jan 2014
Cardiff High	905	906	886	850	831	772
Llanedeyrn High	1017	1003	1013	1082	1125	1116
Llanishen High	1252	1313	1282	1267	1258	1197
Total	3174	3222	3181	3199	3214	3085

It is considered that the opening of Ysgol Pen Y Groes in 2009, the consolidation of Welsh-medium primary school catchment areas over recent years within the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area and the proposal for a new Welsh-medium high school will result in the catchment area projections for English-medium places falling in subsequent years thus allowing for a surplus of up to 10%.

Some of the alternative sites submitted in relation to the Local Development Plan do fall within the catchment zones as stated. However the plan submitted to the Welsh Assembly Government and the Planning Inspectorate by the Council did not include any of these sites and they are not Council proposals. The possible inclusion of these sites within the plan will be a matter for the Inspector to consider in light of the evidence and representations received on the plan.

- 8. Failure to respond to concerns of the safety and affordability of transport**
The distance that the children of Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn will have to travel exceeds that recognised by Cardiff County Council.
The burden placed on roads will lead to increased congestion of already very congested travel routes
Some families will find the cost of travel difficult

This proposal brings together catchment arrangements in an organised fashion and will limit the number of out of catchment children attending Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School which will lead to a reduction in the number of individual car journeys being made across the city.

In addition these proposals will also provide Welsh-medium secondary provision for children in the East of the city reducing the number of journeys currently made by children to access provision at Ysgol Glantaf and Ysgol Plasmawr whilst also meeting growing demand across the city as a whole.

The entitlement to free school transport is based upon the The Learner Travel Measure 2008, issued by the Welsh Assembly Government, which sets out specific requirements for home to school transport in Wales. One of its provisions is to maintain the current distance threshold of 3 miles for pupils receiving secondary education to qualify for free transport between home and the nearest suitable school. Children not entitled to free home to school transport are defined as within reasonable walking distance to school according to the Welsh Learner Travel Measure.

Bus services will be provided for children resident within the Llanishen High School catchment area whose home address lies beyond the statutory 3 mile walking limit. A number of spaces will be available on these buses for fare paying pupils resident within the 3 mile walking limit who wish to take advantage of this service.

As there will be no pupils resident within the Cardiff High School catchment area whose home address is greater than 3 miles from the school it will not be necessary for free home to school transport to be provided.

As part of the re-organisation of schools across Cardiff, the Council intends to work with Cardiff Bus on issues relating to bus timetabling and bus routes in order to establish whether or not minor alterations will enable more children to access direct routes to school at convenient times.

In order to ensure safety directly outside of school sites, School Safety Zones will be established, which will help to formalise the traffic flow, parking regimes and crossing facilities. Cycling routes to and from Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School will also be explored.

Colleagues from Traffic & Transport are happy to discuss available walking routes on an individual basis.

9. Failure to respond to reasonable questions raised by the Governing Body

The Llanedeyrn High School Governing Body is referring to correspondence it sent to Council Members and of which Officers do not have copies. As noted at meetings this was an Officer consultation which identified a process for responses which did not include questions/comments sent to Members. We therefore are unable to comment on what may have been sent to Members and on any response given.

10. Farcical consideration of the Call-in by the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee- the call in failed to engage in any meaningful discussion of the closure of Llanedeyrn High School.

The proposal to close Llanedeyrn High School formed part of a report to Executive on 04 December 2008 which also included proposals relating to St Anne's C/W Infant School, Cefn Onn Primary School and Llanrumney and Rumney High Schools.

Following the Executive meeting Cllr. Cook, a representative serving the Trowbridge area of the city, invoked the call in specifically on issues relating to the proposal to build a new high school on the Rumney Recreation Ground (Easter Leisure Centre site) (details of the call in are at appendix 3). As Llanedeyrn School did not form part of the basis for the call in any issues relating to the school were not considered by the Scrutiny Committee.

11. Failure to provide satisfactory responses to public questions at the full council meeting

The relevant questions, and responses made, are at appendix 4. The consultation was Officer led and as such we are unable to comment on any questions made directly to Members.

12. Cardiff Council has failed to fulfil its own plans and policies

This proposal is entirely in accordance with the priorities as set out in Core Aim 2 of the Cardiff Children and Young People's Plan 2008-2011 specific to 'Education and Learning Opportunities' (CYPP 2008:15). It will "secure for children and young people [in Llanedeyrn] their entitlement to learning through improving access to and engagement with education, employment or training" as well as provide the infrastructure to "develop the learning experiences of children and young people to improve outcomes, success and transition to adult life".

This will be achieved through the phased implementation of a City-wide school reorganisation programme that aims to provide access to high quality learning opportunities for all children in Cardiff including those children currently receiving education in the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area.

Through the proposed reorganisation, high school places in the locality will be consolidated to effectively provide for the local population by ensuring that the education is sustainable and well resourced in buildings that are fit for the purpose of delivering the modern curriculum. It is anticipated that whilst if this proposal were to be agreed the number of schools will reduce (with increased travel distances for a proportion of students) that this will result in an "improvement in the range, quality and accessibility of learning opportunities for all learners".

As identified by the objectors Llanedeyrn High School is located in a densely populated area. This area is however served by Cardiff High School, Llanishen High School, St Teilo's CiW High School and Corpus Christi Catholic High School and Llanedeyrn High School. At January 2009 only 31.8% of children living in the Llanedeyrn catchment area were actually taking up their secondary school place at Llanedeyrn High School. It is therefore acknowledged that whilst there are many

families that actively opt for Llanedeyrn as their local high school, others have originally indicated an alternative school as their school of choice but were unsuccessful in securing a place. It is therefore likely that an equal or greater proportion of the population in the current catchment area will achieve the first choice for their child's secondary education if this proposal is agreed as many parents at present choose to apply for alternative schools and are unsuccessful in accessing their school of choice.

One of the aims of the Strategic Framework is to create the situation that parents will turn with confidence to a local school in the secure knowledge that it will offer a high quality of education. At present only 31.8% of the Llanedeyrn High School catchment pupils opt to attend the school, the lowest in Cardiff. Under this proposal children from the Llanedeyrn High School catchment would attend one of three schools, Cardiff High School, Llanishen High School or St Teilo's Church in Wales High School, in addition to maintaining the opportunity to apply for admission to other local schools, including Corpus Christi Catholic High School or to Welsh-medium. As can be seen in point 2, from the most recent ESTYN inspection reports for these three schools and benchmarking information, the standard of education provided by these schools is good and all of the schools provide supportive, caring environments.

In addition the Strategic Framework also sets out the need to:

'Promote social inclusion by reducing the gap in educational attainment between different groups of people.

Make effective and efficient use of resources by:

Reducing revenue funding spent on surplus places

Realising maximum opportunities for capital funding in order to produce significant investment in school buildings over the period of the plan

Create secure, viable primary schools in every area of the city, the number of these schools matched to the numbers of local children

Seek to establish secondary schools of a size capable of :

Taking all children from the local primary schools

Providing individual learning pathways for pupils post 14

(The desired size of secondary school is in the range between 6 and 10 forms of entry)

Meet the targets of Welsh medium education set out in the Council's Welsh Education Scheme

Seek to create a mix of community, voluntary aided, English and Welsh medium in every area of the city

Organise secondary schools so as to provide maximum opportunities for all young people aged 14-19

We believe that these proposals meet with these criteria and that non-implementation will result in the continued use of financial resources to sustain surplus places, a missed opportunity to invest in schools in the area and to establish, successful, viable schools for the future.

13. Cardiff Council has failed to fulfil WAG guidance on school organisation proposals

All school organisation proposal brought forward by the Council are considered within the context of the Strategic Framework and Welsh Assembly guidance for school organisation proposals.

In regard to specific points raised in the Llanedeyrn Governing Body objection:

The effect on provision for pupils with special educational needs – see point 17.

The effect on accessibility to schools – the majority of children resident within the Llanedeyrn High School catchment will have access to a high school within three miles of their home. For those who live outside the three mile radius free transport will be provided in accordance with Welsh Assembly requirements.

Matching the number, location and type of school places – under this proposal all children within the Llanedeyrn High School catchment will have the opportunity to attend a good quality English-medium community high school, a newly established Welsh-medium community high school or a good quality VA English-medium high school.

With regard to ascertaining the views of those most directly affected including children and young people – the Council considers that it has met all its obligations in terms of consultation on this proposal.

Consultation documents outlining the background to the proposal, rationale and implications were distributed to all parents, staff and governors at the affected schools, Heads and Chairs of nearby schools and other stakeholders.

Consultation documents distributed to parents of children at the schools affected provided consultees with the opportunity to comment on the proposals as well as providing details of the series of meetings at each school for staff, governors and parents/public, at which the proposals were explained and questions answered.

Council officers offered to meet with the Llanedeyrn High School Council; however, this offer received no response.

Drop in sessions were held at Pentwyn Leisure Centre during and after school hours to provide an opportunity for people to express views and ask questions on an individual basis. The purpose of the drop in sessions held during the consultation was to provide information on the proposals being consulted on.

It was therefore considered that sufficient opportunities were made available for members of the Llanedeyrn community to contribute to the consultation via the meetings and the drop in sessions.

The impact on the local families and the community – see point 15.

Alternative uses for the school's facilities – under this proposal there will continue to be a school on the site in addition to Welsh-medium secondary provision being made available locally.

Failure to secure funding- the sources of funding required to implement these proposals are identified in the financial model reported to the Executive Business Meeting. The Authority is therefore clear about what needs to be done to secure the necessary funding and continues to progress plans to achieve this. Ultimately, the Minister would need to be assured of the availability of sufficient funding before approving any School Organisation proposal if he were minded to do so.

14. Alternative solutions

Given that the aim of the SOP is to reduce empty places there is no reason why St Teilo's school should be enabled to expand. The school was not oversubscribed in September 2009. However, if it is to expand its renewal and growth does not have to be located at the LHS site. The SOP makes two sites available in the Rumney area if the closure of Rumney and Llanrumney High Schools proceeds.

One of the aims of School organisation is to reduce surplus places and to achieve a balance in each area, ensuring that the supply of places meets the demand, in English-medium, Welsh-medium and Faith schools.

St Teilo's CiW High School was oversubscribed in September 2009. As the minutes of the admissions panel (dated 27th January 2009) confirm, there were 203 applications for St Teilo's with an Admission Number of 180 places (details at appendix 5).

Two sites will not be made available if the proposal relating to Rumney and Llanrumney High Schools proceeds.

Part of the proposed reorganisation of schools in the East of Cardiff is the establishment of a new school on the Eastern Leisure Centre site. The disposal of part of the Llanrumney High School site and the entire Rumney High School site form part of the financial model which identifies funding for this new school. The remainder of the Llanrumney High School site is to be used to compensate for the loss of recreational space which would be taken up by the proposed new school.

It should also be noted that 43% of children attending St Teilo's CiW High School in January 2009 were resident in the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area (414 of 963). St Teilo's is also fully subscribed and has had to refuse admission to other

local children. This illustrates that the school is already serving the local community, including the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area.

The key aim for the SOP is to create a Welsh medium school in the East Cardiff region. Governors of LHS believe that the LHS site is of sufficient size for a Welsh school to share the site with LHS. By sharing some of the facilities and services the schools could not only reduce costs but could also promote the community focus whilst retaining the separate identities and ethos of each school. This is in line with the thinking behind the School Effectiveness Framework in terms of working with others and the development of professional learning communities across two similar but different learning communities.

The existing Llanedeyrn High School site occupies an area in the region of 9.4 hectares. Building Bulletin 98 (Briefing Frameworks for Secondary School Projects) suggests the need for an overall total site area in the region of 16 hectares to accommodate both an 8 forms of entry 11-16 age secondary school and a 6 forms of entry 11-18 age secondary school.

It can be demonstrated, from Cardiff Council statistics of school capacity and catchment data, that the key driver for the SOP is not 'local schools for local children'. Cardiff High's capacity is 156% of its catchment. The area is largely affluent and mature therefore it is not likely to experience the high levels of population transition as the LHS area. Consequently pupil numbers are forecast to fall in the Cardiff High catchment. Hence an alternative and more suitable proposition for the North East Cardiff cluster of schools is that Cardiff High School is closed and its catchment split between LHS and Llanishen, the new Welsh medium high school is allocated the Cardiff High site. St Teilo's and Corpus Christi remain unchanged. As this solution does not require the build of a new school a proportion of the money saved could be allocated to the refurbishment of all of the schools in the area.

As outlined in point 12 a number of factors influence school organisation proposals including ensuring there are viable schools in which parents will have confidence.

At present only 31.8% of the Llanedeyrn High School catchment population choose to attend the school, in contrast to the Cardiff High catchment population of whom 83% choose to attend the school.

The overall capacity at Cardiff High School, including 6th form is 1549. The Admission Number of 214 allows capacity for 1070 places in Years 7 – 11 (age 11-16).

In January 2009 there were 1018 pupils resident in the Cardiff High School catchment area (95% of the 1070 places), of which 850 attend Cardiff High School (79% of 1070).

In January 2009, 192 pupils resident in the catchment area of Llanedeyrn High School attended either Cardiff High School or Llanishen High School. There were 3

pupils attending Llanedeyrn High School from the catchment area of Llanishen School, and none who attended from the catchment area of Cardiff High School.

Therefore it can be seen that Cardiff High School quite understandably has the confidence of its local catchment population.

The proposals would not only ensure that there would be local schools of an appropriate size to serve the catchment areas of Cardiff High School, Llanedeyrn High School and Llanishen High School, but would also contribute to achieving the aim of 'Local Schools for Local Children' across a wider area of Cardiff. This would result from the removal of excess places local to these three areas thus significantly reducing the ability for children outside of these catchment areas to gain entry to Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School. This would therefore contribute to the viability of schools in the 'Southern arc' of Cardiff.

The table below details the secondary schools attended by pupils resident within the above catchment areas (pupils aged 11-16; PLASC 2009).

Pupils resident in Llanedeyrn High School catchment area: January 2009						
Secondary schools attended	Bryn Celyn Primary School	Glyncoed Infant & Junior School	Llanedeyrn Primary School	Marlborough Junior & Infant School	Springwood Primary School	Total
Llanedeyrn High School	214	86	174	12	156	642
Cardiff High School	29	18	16	33	7	103
Llanishen High School	52	12	8	12	5	89
St Teilo's C.W. High School	114	33	93	105	69	414
Corpus Christi Catholic High School	195	53	71	76	36	431
Welsh-medium Schools	34	10	13	60	3	120
Other English-medium or Faith schools	64	18	44	78	17	221
Total	702	230	419	376	293	2020

Whilst pupil numbers are forecast to fall in the current Cardiff High School catchment area the school continues to be fully subscribed, with unmet demand in each of the past 5 years.

15. Cardiff Council has failed to recognise the need for a community school in an area of social deprivation

Cardiff Council recognises that deprivation is a factor in the community in which Llanedeyrn High School is located.

The Pentwyn Ward was identified as a Priority Neighbourhood in the Council's Neighbourhood Improvement Programme, approved in 2007.

The 2005 Index of Multiple Deprivation showed that the eastern part of the Ward (both Llanedeyrn & Pentwyn estates) were more deprived than the western part, although none of the 10 Lower Super Output Areas (small statistical units) in the Ward fell within the top 10% most deprived in Wales at that time (the qualifying threshold for Communities First designation by the Assembly).

The 2008 Index of Multiple Deprivation shows that 2 Lower Super Output Areas (LSOA) in the eastern part of the Ward now fall within the top 10% most deprived in Wales, and a further LSOA falls within the top 20% most deprived in Wales. On that basis, it could be said that comparatively, deprivation in the area has increased.

In terms of the Skills, Training and Education Domain of the Index of Multiple Deprivation, Pentwyn LSOA 3 is ranked 10th out of 203 LSOA's in Cardiff, Pentwyn 2, 31st and Pentwyn 5, 43rd. LSOA's 2, 3 and 5 cover the eastern part of the Ward, including the area in which Llanedeyrn HS is situated.

In terms of child poverty, Pentwyn LSOA 5 has 49.5% children in Workless Households, LSOA 2, 44.9% and LSOA 8, 49.6%, compared with a city average of 26.1%.

Further information on the Index of Multiple Deprivation, including a plan defining the LSOA's can be found on the Council's web site, under Council / Facts & Stats.

In these proposals, 2 English-medium community schools will serve the area, plus a newly established Welsh-medium community school, and 2 voluntary aided schools. This would include St Teilo's CiW High School with 400 parish places (age 11-16), located on the existing Llanedeyrn High School site.

16. Accessibility of Llanishen High School

Maps of the proposed new catchment areas clearly show that the Llanishen High catchment is illogical and is particularly unsuitable in relation to its distance from the most deprived areas Pentwyn.

Owing to site constraints it would be undesirable to apportion more than one of the existing primary areas to the Cardiff High School catchment.

Pupils residing in the Marlborough Junior School catchment area, the most Southern part of the Llanedeyrn High School catchment, and in the Pontprennau/ North Pentwyn areas would be the furthest from Llanishen High School. As a large number of pupils resident in the Pontprennau/ North Pentwyn areas currently choose to attend Llanishen High School it is logical to apportion this area to Llanishen High School and thus to apportion the Marlborough Junior School catchment to the Cardiff High School catchment.

St Teilo's would be even better placed in the community to serve the pupil population of Pentwyn and subsequently could be expected to represent an attractive local school.

Concerns raised that truancy rate may increase for pupils travelling to Llanishen from Llanedeyrn area

The following statistics show the authorised and unauthorised absence figures for the four schools affected by this proposal

Cardiff High School Attendance 94% Authorised Absence 5.7%
Unauthorised Absence 0.3% (truancy is defined within this category).

St Teilo's CiW High School Attendance 92.9% Authorised Absence 6.6%
Unauthorised Absence 0.5% (truancy is defined within this category)

Llanedeyrn High School Attendance 89.8% Authorised Absence 9.1%
Unauthorised Absence 1.2% (truancy is defined within this category)

Llanishen High School Attendance 92.4% Authorised Absence 6.6%
Unauthorised Absence 1.0% (truancy is defined within this category)

The statistics above have been submitted by each of the schools and are published on the WAG DEWi site. These statistics show that at present Llanedeyrn High School has both the highest authorised and unauthorised absence levels of the four schools. This is despite Llanedeyrn High School having a very high number of pupils from within its local catchment, a higher proportion than for the three other schools.

17. Lack of appropriate provision for vulnerable cohorts

Llanedeyrn High School serves an extremely diverse cohort but clearly has a high proportion of pupils with special educational needs (50.9% on the SEN register). By comparison St Teilo's and Llanishen High School have significantly lower proportion of SEN pupils, 11.2% and 10.3% respectively. The work of the SEN/ALN/Vulnerable support unit at LHS is considered as outstanding practice across the education authority. LHS has developed very comprehensive provision to meet the needs of the high proportion of pupils on the SEN register. LHS Governing Body is extremely concerned that neither of the schools that this cohort is expected to attend have the experience or well developed practices to deal with a large increase in the proportion of SEN pupils and that those pupils could receive much less focus in a larger school.

Cardiff High School, Llanishen High School and St Teilo's CiW High School are schools experienced in meeting the needs of a diverse range of learners, including those with SEN, and have demonstrated their commitment to the inclusion of vulnerable learners. Cardiff High and Llanishen High provide Specialist Resource Bases admitting SEN pupils from across Cardiff.

The Inspection Report for Llanishen High School states that “Pupils with SEN make very good progress and achieve good standards... The provision for learners with SEN is very good, particularly the support for pupils and students with hearing impairment. Individual needs are very well diagnosed. The school’s commitment to inclusion ensures that support of individual needs is very effective and pupils with SEN make very good progress”. (Estyn, March 2009)

At Cardiff High School “almost all pupils of differing abilities, including those with SEN, achieve extremely well regardless of their social, ethnic or linguistic background.... Pupils with additional learning needs receive very good support and often achieve beyond what is expected of them”. (Estyn, Jan 2007).

At St Teilo’s “Pupils with additional learning Needs (ALN) achieve standards which are good in relation to their abilities” (Estyn, Jan 2008).

The closure notice revealed that the Visual Impairment Unit, currently located in LHS, will be relocated to St Teilo’s. Parents of children needing access to this unit will have no choice but to allow their children to attend a faith school regardless of their personal views. There was no consultation relating to the location of this unit.

The Authority consulted with partners including the health authority, the voluntary sector and organisations representing parents, on the proposed re-location to St Teilo’s. The responses were all positive.

17. Substituting a community school with a faith based school with an autonomous admissions policy

St Teilo’s has always maintained a high profile within its local community, and places significant regard to engaging with and supporting it. This can be seen by the following statements to be found in the ESTYN Inspection report of January 2008:

“Partnerships with parents, the community and other providers are strong.”

“The campus is well utilised as a community resource for learning.”

“The school is actively involved in raising large sums of money for a variety of charities both locally and abroad.”

Parents also have the right to express a preference for their catchment area community school which in this case would be either Cardiff High School or Llanishen High School.

18. The Diocese response to the consultation and its lack of commitment to a community school

“The composition of the Governing Body of St Teilo’s does not include community governors that would be familiar with the needs of the community.”

Two members of the current Governing Body of St Teilo's are resident in the Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn areas.

“The Diocese of Llandaff is not pastorally responsible for the community into which it is proposed that the school will move.”

The Memorandum and Articles of Association on the Diocese of Llandaff expressly note the following among the objects of the Diocesan Board of Finance (the legal entity of the Diocese), number 3. a) “to promote and aid further and assist such wholly charitable objects and work of the Church in Wales in the Principality of Wales and in the County of Monmouth generally and in particular in the Ecclesiastical area known as ‘The Diocese of Llandaff’”. 3. a) v) specifically mentions the provision of sites for schools, ‘colleges, play grounds and recreation grounds.’ The new site of St Teilo's CiW High School would thus be held in trusteeship by the Llandaff Diocesan Board of Finance and would continue to be subject to the school's existing Trust Deed and Instrument of Government.

The school would continue to draw a significant proportion of its student population from within the Diocese of Llandaff. Students whose homes are located in the Diocese of Monmouth would continue to attend the school as they have for many years, since the school serves the whole of the east of Cardiff, irrespective of where historic diocesan boundary lines are drawn.

The school has always operated across diocesan boundaries without any conflict of interest, and indeed has had excellent relationships with a variety of churches both within the Church-in-Wales and also outside.

“We would like to know who will scrutinise their implementation of their admissions policy.”

The admissions process for St Teilo's CiW High School, in its new setting, will be the same as any other voluntary aided school, with the governing body being the admissions authority. The Welsh Assembly Government's Statutory Codes for School Admissions and School Admission Appeals issued in July 2009 give specific guidance to all schools regarding their responsibilities in this area.

The Llandaff Diocesan Board of Education and Cardiff Council's Admissions Forum will continue to have the role of ensuring that the school is mindful of its responsibilities in statute, that it is supported through the admissions process each year (including the role of the independent admission appeals process when necessary), and of reminding the school of its responsibilities in law.

“Evidence of the 2008 intake indicates that St Teilo's did not allocate 30 open places in line with its current policy, the actual figure was 11 places.”

As the minutes of the admissions panel (dated 27th January 2008) show 31 children were allocated Parish places, more than the required minimum of 30.

“Anecdotal evidence from a former admissions officer at the school suggests that most of the open places were usually taken by siblings.....who should also have been eligible for Foundation places.”

The school is fastidious in its application of its Admissions policy, criteria and procedures.

19. Public perception of the process in the light of political communication to local residents

As stated elsewhere in this response and made clear in documentation and public meetings. The consultation was Officer led and as such we are unable to comment on any communications that may have been made by local Members outside of the formal Council processes. Officers are unable to anticipate or comment on any perceptions that may have arisen out of any such communications.

20. Llanedeyrn High School is the only community secondary school serving the children of Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn.

As outlined in the table in Paragraph 14, Cardiff High School, Llanishen High School and St Teilo's CiW High School currently attract pupils from the Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn community. In January 2009 there were 606 pupils resident in the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area attending these 3 schools. In recent years each of these schools has been unable to meet the demand for admission from within the current Llanedeyrn High School catchment area. In January 2009, 414 pupils resident in the Llanedeyrn High School catchment area were attending St Teilo's CiW High School. An additional 250 places are being made available at this school under these proposals, and it could therefore be expected that at least 664 children from the local area could be attending St Teilo's should it be relocated to the existing Llanedeyrn High School site. This number is greater than the 642 catchment children attending Llanedeyrn High School at January 2009.

21 These proposals may lead to social unrest amongst the people of Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn. The people of Llanedeyrn and Pentwyn will feel that their children are being removed from the area to make Way for outsiders. This will surely lead to tensions in the community.

This is covered in point 20 and elsewhere in this response.

22. The Council is failing to adhere to mission statements and published policies in respect of fair and equal rights of all resident children to have available to them local schooling and continuity of schooling through secondary education.

See point 6 and point 12.

23. Impact on school communities:

It is proposed that both Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School will be provided with a significant investment package to enable them to cater fully for pupils from the existing Llanedeyrn catchment area who will in future reside within part of their new catchment areas. The total investment package for these two schools is valued at £8 million which includes a provision for contingency and construction cost inflation. Currently both these schools admit pupils from outside their catchment areas. This reorganisation will enlarge the catchment areas which will, in due course, reduce the numbers of non-catchment admissions to the two schools. This reconfiguration should not cause any significant change for either school.

Conclusion

Whilst it is acknowledged that the implementation of the proposals outlined above will be challenging, there is no doubt that failure to move ahead with school reorganisation in Cardiff would pose a serious risk to the future of many schools in the city.

The Council believes that the proposals represent the best option and would address the issue of surplus places within English-medium secondary schools, meet the increasing demand for Welsh-medium education within the East of Cardiff. The proposals would not only ensure that there would be local schools of an appropriate size to serve the catchment areas of Cardiff High School, Llanedeyrn High School and Llanishen High School, but would also contribute to achieving the aim of 'Local Schools for Local Children' across a wider area of Cardiff.

These proposals allow for significant investment in English-medium and Welsh-medium education in the Llanedeyrn, Pentwyn, Cyncoed and Llanishen areas of Cardiff which would enhance the educational opportunities offered to all children.

A significant contribution will be made to resolving priority one repair and disability discrimination (DDA) issues at the Cardiff High School and Llanishen High School sites.

These proposals will address the urgent need for a third Welsh-medium high school, easing pressure on the existing schools, and will go some way toward meeting the demand for Welsh-medium provision outlined in the Council's Welsh Education Scheme.

Yours sincerely



Chris Jones

Chief Officer, Schools & Lifelong Learning
Prif Swyddog, Ysgolion a Dysgu Gydol Oes